Halal tourism's themes, theories and methods: A general **literature review**

MOHAMMAD SHAHIDUL ISLAM * [mohd.sh.islam@bracu.ac.bd]

FARIBA AZIZZADEH ** [sazizzadeh2010@yahoo.com]

ABDERRAHIM LAACHACH *** [laachach.abdo@gmail.com]

SEBASTIAN ZUPOK **** [szupok@wsb-nlu.edu.pl]

JANUSZ SOBOŃ ***** [sj@list.pl]

Abstract | Halal tourism is a rapidly expanding niche that is increasing at an alarming rate. The investigation of the needs, interests, and behavior of Muslim travelers is a professional priority. This is a general literature review aimed at illuminating how the practice and characteristics of halal tourism are described in the current literature. The study employs a theory-based general literature review methodology to investigate the key characteristics of halal tourism, such as the research topics, theories, and methodologies evident in the 28 seminal papers published between 1989 and 2021. Findings reveal the characteristics of halal tourism, the special needs of Muslim tourists, the implications of halal tourism, the awareness and perceptions of halal tourism, and the industry responses currently available. Selected articles examine the significance and philosophy of Islamic tourism and the perception of Muslim travelers in the context of contemporary global tourism developments. There are five primary types of theories discovered: (a) worldviews, (b) testable views, (c) empirical significance, (d) statistical models, and (e) grounded theories. Additionally, literature review, and qualitative and quantitative methods were identified.

Keywords | Halal tourism, Islamic tourism, Islamic destinations, Muslim travelers, themes and theories, literature review

* Brac Business School, Brac University, Dhaka, Bangladesh
** Islamic Azad University, Department of Management, Piranshahr (Urmia), Iran
*** International Higher Institute of Tourism of Tangier, Morocco.
**** Wyższa Szkoła Biznesu National Louis University, Nowy Sącz, Poland
***** Akademia im. Jakuba Paradyża, Gorzów Wlk., Poland

1. Introduction

The tourism industry is increasingly in the search for new customer segments (Battour et al., 2017), and tourism focused on Muslim travelers, such as Islamic tourism, is unquestionably one that has been attracting growing interest among practitioners over the past decades (Gabdrakhmanov et al., 2015). The rapid growth of the Muslim population around the world is one of the critical reasons for this increased attention (El-Gohary, 2016). That is why it is imperative to acknowledge the demographic position of the Muslim community, and their thematic preferences as well as to understand ways in which services should be ready to be offered and managed according to Islamic/Muslim instructions/habits (Stephenson 2014). In fact, Future Market Insights estimates a 4% annual growth (Compound Annual Growth Rate) for halal tourism in the global market during the period [2022-2032]. The global halal tourism market is estimated to have a revenue of US$ 255 billion in 2022 and is expected to reach US$ 365 billion by the end of 2032 (FMI, Report of Market Insights on Halal Tourism, 2022). Besides, more than 160 million Muslim travelers are estimated to have traveled globally in 2019, according to the Global Muslim Travel Index 2022 (MasterCard-Crescent Rating, 2022). Muslim visitor arrivals are expected to reach 230 million by 2028, at an estimated spend of USD 225 billion (MasterCard-Crescent Rating, 2022).

Indeed, understanding the genuine concept of this so-called concept of *Islamic tourism* would lead to discovering the existing phenomenon of its business trends such as the halal market. The idea of halal is still undefined or not apparent to non-Muslim traders and often thought by them to relate only to food and what is allowed to be consumed under Islamic law (Jafari and Scott, 2014). Yet, although important, the perception of halal is much more extensive than just food. The source of what constitutes halal (allowed) and haram (not

allowed/opposite to halal) is derived from the Quran (i.e., the holy book of the almighty Allah), Prophet Mohammed's teachings and sayings (i.e., Allah's messenger), for example (1) male and female guests prefer to be served by same-gender service employees, (2) the source of beef, chicken, mutton, while pork is not allowed due to its food habit, should be according to Quranic instructions, such as animal should be slaughtered/sacrificed in the name of Allah, and should not be killed by gunshot or electric shock (El-Gohary, 2016). Thus, many more things, such as cultural events, Ramadan service (e.g., compulsory fasting month), and separate recreation zones for male and female tourists are involved with the halal market. Notably, for Muslims, the Quran guides all aspects of human activities; therefore, religion influences the direction of tourism choices by Muslim tourists (Stodolska & Livengood, 2006). As a result, many non-Muslim countries provide alternatives for Muslim tourists to choose from by upgrading the tourism facilities for the comfort of the tourists (Demirel & Yasarsoy, 2017).

When looking at the wide variety of scholarly contributions on Halal tourism and the large array of issues that they cover, an important question arises: after several years of research, what is the current status of Halal tourism's themes, theories and methods?

In order to propose an adequate answer to our research question, the aim of this paper is to review and analyze the academic progress of Halal tourism. More precisely, four research sub-questions are enumerated below:

> (i) How the practice and characteristics of halal tourism are described in the current literature?
>
> (ii) What are the unexplored issues and challenges of halal tourism?
>
> (iii) What are the specific needs of Muslim tourists?

(iv) What are the implications and the perception of halal tourism?

Indeed, the present research further reminds the needs of this increasingly large travel market while existing studies repeatedly emphasize the requirements for Halal food, Halal restaurants, religious practices, and Halal-compliant accommodation, tours, and travel (Oktadiana, Pearce & Chon, 2016; Battour et al., 2016; Azizzadeh, 2019). It tries also to detect whether there are interest, attention and further signs of openness towards these kinds of products in Islamic tourism. There is a need to appreciate how Islamic principles and practices are manifest within the context of themes, theories and methods. In fact, the originality of our research is circumscribed by the adopting of a scientific perspective to deal with the themes addressed, theories adopted and methods used to highlight halal tourism. Thus, this paper investigates how to determine and apply the concept of Islamic tourism in research themes, theories and methods by extracting themes from 28 articles focused on halal tourism published in 14 journals indexed in the SCOPUS.

2. Literature review

2.1. Islamic tourism or halal tourism?

The use of the term Islamic rather than halal tourism -in the tourism sector- has raised much debate among academics (El-Gohary, 2016; Battour et al., 2017; Battour, 2018; Mounesan & Azgomi, 2020). It is difficult to determine the correct terminologies and to properly identify the concept of halal tourism. The confusion identified between these two terms is often explained by the multidisciplinary scope of the topic (Battour et al., 2016; Yagmur et al., 2019). Indeed, the terms are very often used interchangeably by researchers as if the two terms are not different (see, e.g. Hender-

son, 2009; Zamani-Farahani & Henderson, 2010; Battour et al., 2011; Battour et al., 2014; Jafari & Scott, 2014; Stephenson, 2014; Suban et al., 2021). Nevertheless, the use of the concepts "halal tourism"and "Islamic tourism"as synonyms is a matter of scientific debate.

According to Al-Qaradawi (2013), the term Halal characterizes everything that is permitted, concerning which no restrictions exist, and the realization of which the lawgiver, "Allah,"is authorized"(Al-Qaradawi, 2013). Under Islamic law (Sharia), Halal tourism refers to any tourism practice or activity that is "permissible"according to Islamic teaching (Sharia). However, the concept "Islamic"describes what directly relates to the faith and its doctrines (Islamic law, Sharia, Islamic values, principles, and beliefs, and Islamic worship) (Douglass & Shaikh, 2004).

Referring to the literature, some researchers have advanced definitions of Islamic tourism and halal tourism in the tourism and destination marketing literature. We cite as examples: Timothy & Iverson, 2006; Zamani-Farahani & Henderson, 2010; Battour et al., 2014; Carboni et al., 2014. But these definitions have not been accurate and they use "Halal"and "Islamic"in interchangeable ways, moreover, they have not considered the target customers, the product and service offered, the location of the activity, the purpose of the trip and the Islamic law (Battour et al., 2016; Yagmur et al., 2019). Furthermore, Carboni et al. (2014) consider that Islamic tourism is not only about Muslims, not only for Muslim countries and it is not only for religious purposes. It has also been argued that Islamic tourism is often practiced for religious and pilgrimage reasons and it focuses on actions that are based on Islamic principles (Henderson, 2016). But, halal tourism is a type of tourism that is used for various purposes, including recreational or social drive (Ryan, 2016).

In this paper, we borrow the extensive definition advanced by Battour and Ismail for halal tourism and adopted by Boğan and Sarıışık (2019)

"any tourism object or action, the use or engagement of which by Muslims in the tourism industry is permitted by Islamic teachings."(Battour & Ismail, 2016). However, we accept that Islamic tourism is a kind of tourism that appeared as a result of individuals' preferences to travel to obtain God's consent (Boğan & Sarıışık, 2019). The factors that encourage individuals to take part in a tourist activity are Islamic (i.e., they come from the Quran and Sunnah). It differs from religious tourism, which involves all religions. In Islam, individuals who engage in Islamic tourism activities (e.g., reading the verses mentioned by God in the book of the universe (Quran), i.e., contemplation) will earn rewards from God (Battour, 2018).

2.2. Literature review on Halal and Islamic tourism

While halal tourism is beginning to receive widespread attention in the literature, the existing literature remains in its embryonic stages. By referring to concepts related to religion and religiosity, many academics have tried to consider the prospects of this global phenomenon on the demand aspect as well as on the supply aspect (Prayag, 2020). Halal tourism is emerging as a new niche in the tourism industry. It is an open field for improvement (Chandra, 2014). It is important to point out that some countries, whether Muslim or non-Muslim have started to introduce this concept in their countries to attract more tourists. With the implementation of this concept in many countries, the halal tourism segment will definitely grow and as a result, the number of Muslim travelers will experience an evolution (Suharko et al., 2018). Indeed, given the remarkable growth of Halal Tourism, Indonesia has introduced normative and positive regulations that govern this niche (Adinugraha et al., 2021). In addition, the Indonesian island of Lombok has implemented services, restaurants, spiritual requirements, and other elements related to the halal brand (Rahmawati et al., 2021).

Rasul (2019) attempted to conduct a systematic review by clarifying definitions, concepts, and scope while identifying knowledge gaps and challenges. Furthermore, some scholars (e.g. Battour & Ismail, 2016; Hall & Prayag, 2020) state that there is no consensus between Muslim and non-Muslim countries on the interpretation and application of Shari'ah principles, from which the concept of Halal Tourism is derived (source). Various studies have been conducted in different countries. We mention for example and not exhaustive: Malaysia (Rahman et al., 2020; Said et al., 2020), Indonesia (Abror et al., 2019; Aji et al., 2020; Ratnasari et al.,2020; Adinugraha et al., 2021), Turkey (Battour et al.,2018), China (Jia & Chaozhi, 2020), Italy (Carboni et al., 2014), New Zealand (Prayag, 2020), Jordan (Harahsheh et al., 2019), etc.

This current review considers pertinent scientific examinations conducted by numerous researchers from different nations (e.g. Douglas & Shaikh, 2004; Battour et al., 2010, 2011, 2012; Brdesee et al., 2013; Rahman, 2014; Eid & El Gohary, 2015; Battour et al., 2017, 2018; Wardi et al., 2018; Abror et al., 2020; Pradana et al., 2020; Prayag, 2020; Preko et al., 2020; Rahman et al., 2020; Said et al., 2020; Tiamiyu et al., 2020; Sofyan et al., 2021; Tangvitoontham & Sattayanuwat, 2022) to illuminate how the practice and characteristics of halal tourism are described in the current literature.

3. Methodology

For the sake of transparency and consistency of results, this review is largely based on the process proposed by Denyer and Tranfield (2009). The approach proposed by these two authors is commonly used by researchers, principally in the field of Tourism and Hospitality Management (e.g., Aladag et

al., 2020; Montenegro et al., 2022). It is a rigorous approach that is compatible with our research objectives.

As a preliminary step, we developed the research question for this study: how does the literature define and characterize Halal tourism? Second, we combed through the existing literature on the themes, theories, and methodologies of Islamic tourism research to identify the sources that would assist us in constructing our theoretical framework. Thirdly, we solicited the assistance of two expert peers who could assist us in avoiding bias in our source selection procedure. Finally, we synthesized the literature from prior research that ultimately shaped the findings of this investigation. According to Denyer and Tranfield (2009), a general literature review consists of the following four steps:

    i. Locating the studies;

    ii. Selecting and evaluating the studies;

    iii. Analysing and summarizing the available evidence;

    iv. Presenting the results

3.1. Locating studies

This step involves specifying clear inclusion and exclusion criteria. Indeed, the dataset used in our study only originated from the Scopus database. Our choice is justified by the fact that Scopus generally has greater coverage than other databases like the Web of Science, especially in Business and management research (Harzing & Alakangas, 2015; Mongeon & Paul-Hus, 2015). To ensure the quality of control, our research was limited to the "Tourism, Leisure and Hospitality Management" subject area, including only journals indexed in the SCOPUS database in the English language literature. The first search (August 01, 2022) presented 129 journals. We used the root search strings "Halal tourism*" and "Islamic tourism*" to detect

relevant studies. Moreover, to cover all papers associated with Halal tourism, we added a series of keywords and search strings: "Trends on Halal tourism *"; "Halal industry *"; "Muslim travelers *"; and "Religious tourism *." Following the criteria established, it is to be noted that we have eliminated some articles related to the subject of Halal Tourism but they are not part of the subject area: Tourism, Leisure and Hospitality Management. Table 2 shows the list of journals selected.

3.2. Selection and evaluation of studies

We analyzed the selected articles to check if their content was related to halal tourism (abstracts, keyword screening and full-text screening). We excluded the articles that did not meet the eligibility criteria. In addition to the criteria defined previously, the eligibility criteria added included (i) widely focusing on the characteristics and definitions of Halal tourism, (ii) broadly involving the themes, theories and methods of Islamic tourism research. After checking the abstracts and keywords, we selected 28 articles.

3.3. Analysis and summarize the available evidence

In this step, firstly we coded the papers according to the criteria cited in Table 3. Then, we analyzed and summarized the available evidence to comprehend how the literature characterizes Halal tourism. We show the results and crucial contributions of the analysis and synthesis themes and methods in the following parts.

In terms of identifying theories, the author follows the explanation of Smith et al. (2013) which is acknowledged as a reliable way to present a comprehensive view of positioning theories in existing knowledge in a specific field, such as hospitality, tourism, and leisure studies (Swanson & DeVereaux, 2017). Table 1 shows the uses of the concept theory documented by Smith et al. (2010).

Table 1 | Uses of the concept theory documented by Smith et al. (2013)

Category	Description
Theory of the first type (Type 1)	The theory is connected with the natural sciences and is the form of the theory underlined by Wacker (1998).
Theory of the second type (Type 2)	The theory is connected with complex social science phenomena. Testing the hypotheses of this type of theory can generate equivocal findings.
Theory of the third type (Type 3)	The theory is connected with the statistical models that are presented and described as theory. However, this kind of theory is not approved and tested a priori in the conceptual model.
Theory of the fourth type (Type 4)	It can be an untested/untestable verbal or graphic model. It differs from type 3 in that Type 4 theories are not falsifiable by an independent observer.
Theory of the fifth type (Type 5)	This type includes epistemology or a research design presented and formulated as a theory.
Theory of the sixth type (Type 6)	Grounded theory: it is more of an inductive methodological process than a result in the form of a testable, predictive theory.
Theory of the seventh type (Type 7)	The theory is a casual term used as an analogy. In fact, the borrowing of an existing theory from other fields is an analogy in tourism.

Table 2 | Journal title lists

N°	Journal title	Number of Articles
1	Annals of Tourism Research	2
2	Tourism Management Perspectives	8
3	Tourism Management	2
4	Current Issues in Tourism	1
5	Journal of Vacation Marketing	1
6	Tourism Review	3
7	Journal of Destination Marketing & Management	1
8	Current Issues in Tourism	1
9	Asia Pacific Journal of Tourism Research	1
10	Journal of Tourism and Cultural Change	1
11	Tourism Recreation Research	2
12	International Journal of Culture, Tourism and Hospitality Research	1
13	Journal of Islamic Marketing	3
14	The Journal of Asian Finance, Economics and Business	1

Table 3 | Criteria of analysis

Criterion	Analysis
Date of publication	[1989-2021]
Source of publication	Articles belong to journals indexed in the SCOPUS database.
Subject area	Tourism, Leisure and Hospitality Management
Journal Quality	Q1, Q2, Q3 and Q4
Goal	Identification of the key theme of the publications.

4. Results and discussions

4.1. Themes

The themes of the 28 articles are centrally focused on Halal tourism, and specifically include some important topics, such as Halal food and beverage, Islamic hospitality systems, prospects and challenges of Islamic tourism, stakeholders' opinions on Islamic tourism, guidelines and importance of Islamic tourism management in the rise of Muslim travellers' mobility, Islamic heritage and politics, comparisons of Muslim travellers' perceptions among destinations, the needs and demands of Muslim travellers. For the comprehensive and convenient understanding of the themes identified in the 28 articles, this study has categorized the above themes into two categories: *(a) understanding Halal tourism, and (b) understanding Muslim travellers' needs*, concurrently, which have been the nucleus of the articles as well. Both the categories are discussed below.

(a) Understanding Islamic tourism

Islam means total submission to the will and commandments of Allah, and Allah (God) is the creator of all creatures, including humankind. Muhammad/Muhammed (peace be on him) is the final/last messenger of the almighty Allah. A Muslim is a person who submits to the will of Allah wilfully, regardless of their race, nationality or ethnic background (Din, 1989; Stodolska & Livengood, 2006, Jafari & Scott, 2014).

Muslims around the world believe that the holy book of the Al-Quran and Sunnah or Hadith, containing the sayings and deeds of the Prophet Muhammad recalled by his companions and family, is what directs their life (Zamani-Farahani and Henderson, 2009). With this said, it is essential to know what is allowed (Halal) and forbidden (Haram) in Islam when it comes to travel and leisure and how it can influence an individual's travel behaviour. "Islam is not just a religion and certainly not just a fundamentalist political movement. It is a culture or civilization, a way of life that varies from one Muslim country to another but is spirited by a common core" (Mazrui, 1997, p. 118).

Jafari and Scott (2014), Samori, Salleh and Khalid (2016) cited to address the encouragement of tourism in Islam:

In the Quran, where Allah says:

> "Do they not travel through the land, so that their hearts (and minds) may thus learn wisdom and their ears may thus learn to hear? Truly, it is not their eyes that are blind, but their hearts, which are in their breasts." (Surah al-Hajj:46).
> "Travel through the earth and see how Allah did originate creation; so will Allah produce a later creation: for Allah has power over all things"(Surat Al-Ankabout: 20).

Surah Al-An'am (literally, The Cattle) urges people to roam about the earth, to consider the destiny of those who preceded them, especially those who cast aspersions on God's Word: say: "Travel through the earth and see what was the end of those who rejected Truth" (Surat Al-An'am, 11).

> "Islamic tourism is, thus, an interesting and powerful phenomenon in which religion and tourism are inextricably linked in a close and complex relationship. It describes both human activities and commercial products which are shaped by religious principles and practices. Such is the nature of Islam that it encompasses every facet of life and demands adherence to laws which extend their influence to individual tourists, the operation of the industry and functioning of government" (Henderson, 2009, p. 209).

(b) Understanding Muslim travelers' needs

Recently, research on Muslim travel management has drawn much attention from the academic community at the juncture of rapid expansion of Muslim travelers' volume and value, of provoking the interest of the tourism industry worldwide. Today, the essentials of a sound knowledge of their demands and needs on products, leisure, recreation and social purposes that comply with Islamic teaching have been an urgent call to both Muslim and non-Muslim destinations to contemplate the management and design of these issues. The selected papers have provided a series of guidelines for Muslim travel management, which are explicitly summarized below.

While traveling, Muslims prefers and needs to maintain religious rules and regulations, such as five times prayer a day, prohibition for women to travel alone without company, taking food accor-

ding to the Quran (The Holy Book) and words of the Prophet (peace be upon him), that is termed as Halal (allowed to take or prepared upon Islamic directions), e.g., beef, juice, and Haram (not allowed to take), e.g., pork, wine. The requirements include prayer rooms, especially for female tourists, stationed security guards at the beaches at night for the safety for tourists' wives and daughters; restaurant marked with Halal food logo; tourism activities within the framework of Islamic law and regulations; direction sign towards mosque (prayer house); separate restrooms for women, Arabic wording for direction or welcome notation; Islamic symbols across the hotels, for example, directional arrows towards Mecca for obligatory prayers, training arrangement for non-Muslim staff to serve and handle Muslim guests, so that they can understand the basis of standard Islamic practices; capitalizing Muslim festivals such as Ramadan (Fasting month), Eid (annual festivals) and developing carnivals in respect of Islamic law and Muslim recreational hypes (Maedeh & Mazhar, 2010; Chanin et al., 2015; Shakona et al., 2015; Chanin et al., 2015; Samori, Salleh & Khalid, 2016; Mohsin, Ramli & Alkhulayfi, 2016; Henderson, 2016; Harahsheh et al., 2019).

Despite the importance of Halal food for Muslims and the growth of Muslim visitation, most of the non-Muslim destinations still show their low scale of awareness to include this importance in their tourism planning and strategy. Initiatives are being undertaken and advanced by some Muslim and non-Muslim destinations to improve Halal delivery for Muslim tourists, but there remains a need for essential changes in tourism planning at the global levels to attract Muslim tourists. Research works such as surveys at both national and international levels to gather firsthand information, and the exploration of the potential of Halal food in the development and promotion of the tourism sector in both Muslim and non-Muslim countries have become an urge in the view of global tourism trend towards the rapid expansion of Muslim travellers'

volume and value (Maedeh & Mazhar, 2010; Kim, Im & King, 2015; Chanin et al., 2015; Shakona et al., 2015; Mohsin, Ramli & Alkhulayfi, 2016; Henderson, 2016; Carboni, Perelli & Sistu, 2017).

In sum, Oktadiana, Pearce and Chon (2016) precisely suggested the following five future research agendas with factual new data to improve understanding of Muslim travelers, such as:

i. The management of the separation of sexes in everyday recreational activities

ii. The consideration of how to support cultural and religious Islamic occasions

iii. The meaning and power of travel for individual well-being in Islamic life

iv. The study of shopping preferences and needs, and

v. The nuances of direct verbal and non-verbal interaction with Muslim guests.

4.2. Theories identified in the studies

Across the 28 papers, this study identified 5 types of theories used in the articles (see the explanation in Table 4), such as Type 1, 2, 3, 4, 5, 6 and 7 (see the original Smith-Lee taxonomy in Table 1) (Smith et al., 2013), which are examined below. In fact, Type 5 theory (epistemology as theory) was the predominant use of theory (a total of 13 articles from 28 articles selected for analysis). Type 2 theories (tested social science theories) occurred in about 11 of 28 Halal tourism articles. Type 4 theory (an untested model) is presented in two articles. One example of Type 6 (grounded theory) and one Type 3 theory (statistical models) was observed. Type 7 (analogical theory) and Type 1 theory (natural science-type theory) did not appear in any articles.

Theory type-5

Theory Type 5 seems silent but significantly plays a role in placing critical arguments in the research. Across the study, theory Type 5 specifies what questions are legitimate to ask, and how available data or deliverable information is to be analysed and interpreted. It presents a worldview and identifies which queries and data are appropriate for scholarly enquiry and which are not. In fact, the light of theory Type 5 is available in 13 studies (See the first thirteen articles in Table 4). For instance, Din (1989) described the pattern of tourist arrival in Muslim countries and examined the extent to which the religious factor has bearing on policy and development strategy affecting tourism; Samori, Salleh and Khalid (2016) explored and illustrated the concept of Halal tourism within the Islamic context with particular reference to Quranic verse and Hadith (primary sources in Islam); Stephenson (2014) examined the principles and practices of Islamic hospitality, outlining the diverse ways in which Islam intersects with 'hospitality' and the 'hospitality industry'; Maedeh and Mazhar (2010) investigated at both Muslim and non-Muslim tourism sites how availability of halal food has influenced the selection of a particular destination for vacation by Muslims; Henderson (2009) sought to afford insights into the nature and significance of Islamic tourism as a human and commercial activity; Neveu (2010) argued that Islamic tourism is noteworthy for the way it reveals the politics heritage in Jordan, and Jafari and Scott (2014) encouraged the discussion of Islam and tourism, a topic that involves both religious and secular issues, of global significance and of academic and practical importance in this field. Henderson (2016) reported the recent trends and underlying determinants, making specific reference to circumstances in Japan. Through t-test, Mohsin, Ramli and Alkhulayfi (2016) raised awareness, by adopting Secondary information and literature review, about the growing Halal tourism

market segment and identified the fundamental needs of this segment; Vargas-Sánchez and Moral-Moral (2019) showed that the tourism industry faces challenges that it must confront in order to evolve towards the authentication of the halal tourism offer, including the role of new technologies and the digital economy; Ultimately, Moshin et al. (2020) reported that the lack of awareness and misconceptions about halal tourism in New Zealand. The basic requirements of Muslim and traditional tourists, like the level of service, and their travel motivations are similar. In addition, Adinugraha et al. (2021) adopted a conceptual scholarly enquiry about the need to implement a normative rule and a legal framework to govern Halal tourism. Indeed, they discuss fatwa Number: 108/DSN-MUI/IX/2016 concerning the application of tourism based on sharia principles and the West Nusa Tenggara Regional Regulation Number. 2 of 2016 regarding Halal Tourism. Sofyan et al. (2021) adopted a systematic review to prove that Islam teaches many principles, behavioral responses and psychological responses to disasters and crises. As a consequence, the advantage of halal tourism is that Muslims make Islamic teachings the basis for social resilience to disasters.

Theory type-2

Eid and El-Gohary (2015), Oktadiana, Pearce and Chon (2016), Battour et al. (2017), Wardi et al. (2018), Isa et al. (2018), Harahsheh et al. (2019), Rahman et al. (2020), Ainin et al. (2020), Papastathopoulos et al. (2020), Suhartanto et al. (2021) and Suhartanto et al. (2021) have applied Theory Type 2 in their studies. Smith et al. (2013) defined Theory Type 2 as tested social science theories associated with tested empirical models. For instance, Battour et al. (2017) applied the theory of push-and-pull motivation to show that religion significantly moderates the relationship between pull motivation and tourist satisfaction. However, the moderating effect of religion on the rela-

tionship between push motivation and tourist satisfaction was not supported; while Oktadiana Pearce and Chon (2016) identified the comprehensiveness of the research and commentary available concerning the needs of Muslim travelers by adopting the theory of Coordinated Management of Meaning (CMM). They found the need better to identify Muslim travelers' needs from the Culture norms, Verbal and non-verbal communication, Life Scripting, and Relationships domains. Building on the structural equation modelling (SEM) as a substantial analytical tool for testing cause-effect-relationships models with latent variables, the partial least squares structural equation modeling (PLS-SEM) was used by authors to test the structural and the measurement model of our research. Thus, the main results obtained are:

    i. Halal tourism attributes impact significantly the tourist satisfaction and word of mouth;

    ii. Most of non-Muslim tourists think that halal tourism products and services in traveling to Muslim friendly destinations, are subjective to discover the Muslim cultures;

    iii. Tourist loyalty intention is assigned to the satisfaction of non-Muslim tourists;

    iv. Three Muslim tourist profiles are identified: utilitarian Muslim guests, independent Muslim guests and leisure Muslim guests;

    v. Hoteliers need to develop personalized services to satisfy this segment's customers.

    vi. Using explanatory factor analysis, Harahsheh et al. (2019) concluded that Halal tourism in Jordan is established, but it needs to be improved and promoted.

    vii. Using SEM-PLS, Isa et al. (2018) show that social variables and price did not influence on tourist satisfaction, while emotion, quality, and physical and non-physical halal

attributes had a direct impact on tourist satisfaction, especially with the mediating effect of the destination experience.

Theory type-4

It seems to be the basis of the theory Type-3, except that Type 4 theory is not falsifiable by an independent observer and it adopts existing theories to explain a defined phenomenon, without proposing testable empirical hypotheses. This is a question of untested models Smith et al. (2013). Based on these kinds of theories, Carboni and Janati (2016) explored locals' perceptions of tourism products in line with Islamic prescriptions to intercept and embrace the demand for the halal tourism market. It has been revealed that Halal tourism is not yet duly conceptualized or defined even at the juncture of its rapid growth, for which there remains a certain degree of vagueness regarding this concept because of its loose definition and lack of full institutionalization in Fez (Morocco). Additionally, Kim et al. (2015) explored emerging destination brand positioning typologies and assessed the competitiveness of Japan, Korea, and China in accommodating the preferences of Malaysian Muslim tourists. Malaysian Muslim travelers perceived Korea as a superior destination brand to China. In the comparison between Korea and Japan as brand positioning, Malaysian travelers perceived Japan as a higher brand than Korea.

Theory type-6

Smith et al. (2013) ranked Grounded Theory in the 6th. They noted Glaser and Strauss, (1967) that Grounded theory is not about data collection, but also the inductive analysis and interpretation of data collected that is then considered theory. In the same way, Shakona et al. (2015) used Grounded Theory to explore the influence of Islamic beliefs and practices on the leisure and travel behavior

of Muslims in Clemson, South Carolina. Their results show that Islamic beliefs and behavioral practices influence the leisure and travel behavior of Muslims in the USA. The study identifies seven major themes that play an essential role in determining the leisure and travel behavior of Muslims in Clemson. These are the importance of mosques, traveling with a Mohram, Hijab and a dress code for men and women, drinking alcohol and being in places where alcohol is served, eating pork, Holy Month of Ramadan and Dabiha.

Theory type-3

According to Smith et al. (2013), Theory type-3 is assimilated to statistical analysis, but it does not use a priori-tested conceptual model. Carboni et al. (2014) adopted various methods (consultation of secondary sources, observations and interviews with a group of 14 key informants) to report that the rising interest in Islamic tourism appears to have not yet gained momentum in Djerba. Its development is currently not seen as a priority in Tunisia.

4.3. Identified methods

Building on the selected articles, the aim of this section is to compare the different scientific methods used with the results obtained in the context of Halal tourism.

4.3.1 Different methods but the same points of results

Results: guidelines for managing Muslim travellers
Method used:

i. Secondary information and literature review (Neveu, 2010; Mohsin et al., 2016; Samori, Salleh & Khalid, 2016; Semi-

structured interviews (Shakona et al., 2015)

ii. Partial least square: (Papastathopoulos et al., 2020)

iii. Interviews with a group (Moshin et al., 2020)

All the above different methods have produced the same points of results, for example, how to cater to Muslim travelers, their needs and requirements while they are travelers, their liking and disliking during tourism activities and the estimates for halal tourism trends.

Results: the nature and characteristics of Islamic tourism
Method used:

i. Secondary information and literature review (Din, 1989; Henderson, 2009; Jafari and Scott, 2014; Oktadiana et al., 2016; Vargas-Sánchez and Moral-Moral, 2019)

ii. Observations and interviews with the group (Carboni et al., 2014; Ainin et al., 2020)

iii. Partial least square (Battour et al., 2017; Wardi et al., 2018; Suhartanto et al., 2021)

iv. SEM (Eid & El-Gohary, 2015)

Though there are applications of different methods, they almost have produced the same points of findings, such as how Islamic tourism evolves according to Islamic law and instructions, what are the relationships between religious doctrines and Muslim travelers' needs and demands, and what should the destination management take the initiatives against the nature and characteristics of Muslim travelers in the backdrop of catering the larger volumes of their travel mobility across the globe.

In sum, the term "Halal" is the translation of "permitted" or "allowed" in Arabic. It is an adjective that does not only apply to foods, but it

spreads to all other areas (banking sector, cosmetic sector, tourism...), it refers to operations and items that conform to Islamic law. In effect, practicing Muslims are expected to respect what is dictated in Islamic law, including even in the areas of travel and tourism (Khoiriati et al., 2018). There is no universal definition for halal tourism accepted by all. These interpretations vary from one author to another and sometimes it is confused with Islamic worship (Hajj and Umrah). It has been found that when talking about Halal tourism, it is imperative to consider the Islamic principles that apply to the target clientele (Muslim or non-Muslim), the locations of activity (Muslim or non-Muslim country), the products and services offered (meals and facilities), the products and services offered (meals and facilities), and even the purpose of travel (Battour & Ismail, 2016).

Results: perceptions of Islamic tourism
Method used:

 i. Literature review (Vargas-Sánchez and Moral-Moral, 2019)

 ii. Semi-structured interviews (Carboni & Janati, 2016; Harahsheh et al., 2019)

 iii. Interviews with a group (Moshin et al., 2020)

 iv. t-test (Kim, Im & King, 2015)

 v. Partial least square: (Isa et al.,2018; Suhartanto et al., 2021)

 iv. Structural equation modeling: (Rahman et al., 2020)

In the above different methods, the authors aimed to investigate the perceptions of Muslim travellers and stakeholders, what are their views regarding the destinations where there is a growth of Muslim travellers, and whether there is a need of adopting halal tourism. The participants or population showed their perceptions regarding the call

of Halal tourism, and the destination choice in the access points of service consumption based on Islamic law and regulations.

It is essential to propose halal services to interest Muslim tourists. But, the variety of interpretations has prohibited the being of a single certification. The major obstacle to overcome this sector is the lack of knowledge and the non-standardization of rules to build an international legal framework (Vargas-Sánchez & Moral-Moral, 2019).

4.3.2 The Same methods and the same results

Results: preparation, awareness and planning of Islamic tourism
Method used:

 i. Secondary information and literature review (Stephenson, 2014; Henderson, 2016; Mohsin, Ramli & Alkhulayfi, 2016; Moshin et al., 2020; Sofyan et al., 2021)

Based on the above method, the authors suggested how to receive and manage Muslim travelers while their tourism preferences are based on Islamic doctrines; such as along with Muslim tourists, non-Muslim tourists' perceptions can also be investigated regarding Halal services consumption in the eye of unified tourism management; moreover, halal airlines, Islamic village tourism, Islamic cruises can be planned and developed.

However, we have noticed that among the miscellaneous methods identified, a marked increase in the use of Partial least square as a method in the last two years. In general, partial least squares structural equation modeling (PLS-SEM) is emerging as a new generation technique that is beginning to have an important place in scientific research despite its recent genesis. Moreover, PLS-SEM is widely used in the fields of business, management and social sciences (Dash & Paul, 2021). The marked increase in the use of this method over the last two years in Halal tourism can be explai-

ned by this general trend in management sciences and also by the need to deal with unobservable or latent variables (tourist perceptions, satisfaction, predictive models…). Indeed, the use of SEM-PLS has been advocated to address these kinds of issues. In addition, PLS-SEM allows analyzing jointly the relations between observable and latent variables (evaluation of the measurement model) and the relations between latent variables (evaluation of the structural model) (Hair et al., 2020; Laachach & Ettahri, in press). According to Sarstedt et al. (2020) SEM-PLS has become a usual tool for analyzing complex inter-relationships between observed and latent variables in tourism (over 279 articles that were produced using SEM-PLS between 2000 and 2017 in the field of Hospitality, Tourism and Hospitality & tourism).

5. Theoretical robustness and conclusion

This article shows the characteristics of halal tourism, the special needs of Muslim tourists, the consequences of halal tourism, the awareness and perceptions of halal tourism, and the current industry responses. The selected articles examine the importance and philosophy of Islamic tourism as well as the understanding of Muslim travelers in the context of contemporary global tourism developments. Five main types of the theory were discovered: (1) worldviews, (2) testable perspectives, (3) empirical significance, (4) statistical models, and (5) grounded theories. In addition, in the research literature, qualitative and quantitative methods were identified.

In general, the selected articles explored the phenomenon of Halal tourism and suggested how to manage this special phenomenon based on religious fervour as a matter of travellers' intention, demand, and requirements. To explore and understand the particular phenomenon of Islamic tourism, the authors of 28 articles employed six dif-

ferent types of methods through 5 different types of theories. This review observes more or moderates pieces of evidence of the theoretical robustness across the selected articles, but, specifically, studies of Din (1989); Neveu (2010); Stephenson, 2014; Jafari and Scott (2014); Eid and El-Gohary, (2015); Shakona et al. (2015); Oktadiana Pearce and Chon (2016) seem comparatively theoretically robust, compared with other studies (see Table 3), their research designs are controlled, rigorous, systematic, valid and verifiable, and critical, because their main characteristics are found as generalizable to other settings, logical rationale, and tied to theory and these studies generated new questions and cyclical in nature. They are found to address directly or indirectly, some real problems in the world.

However, these studies (28 articles) regardless of theoretical robustness contributed, to understating Halal tourism and raised an urge why we should study and plan for what Muslim tourists want, and how to manage them while Muslim travel is a fast-growing market across the globe. Besides, these studies suggested that destinations striving to attract Muslim tourists should attend to multiple aspects of the Halal lifestyle, more precisely, tourism and travel activities and services should be offered and designed in the light of Islamic doctrines. In addition, these combined results can be used by scholars or researchers in the future to focus on the fundamental tenets of Islam regarding the enlargement of Islamic tourism in both Muslim and non-Muslim countries. The scope of our review includes the issues of Halal tourism, recognition of the potential of Muslim-oriented tourism, Islamic hospitality and its development, and the influence of Islamic beliefs and practices on leisure and travel behaviour and tourist experience in Halal tourism. It includes the work of pioneer authors in the field and provides a valuable starting point for new exploration. Furthermore, this can also strengthen the strategic initiatives to support Muslim travellers' loyalty and to meet the expec-

tations of Muslim tourists in terms of satisfaction.

In the past, Halal tourism was mainly limited to Hajj and Umrah pilgrimages, but it currently covers many other travel destinations and activities. In fact, in addition to the fact that the development of the Halal tourism market is accelerating due to population growth, the Islamic world represents a significant component of tourism markets and destinations. According to FMI (Report of Market Insights on Halal Tourism, 2022), many countries have already introduced tourism offerings that conform to the religious beliefs of Muslim tourists (e.g., Malaysia, Turkey, Egypt). In addition, other non-Muslim countries (e.g., Singapore, Australia, and France) have shown considerable interest to develop the halal tourism industry by capitalizing on the existence of halal certified organizations such as food establishments (FMI, Report of Market Insights on Halal Tourism, 2022). In order to achieve a solid and sustainable growth for Halal tourism, it is recommended to provide the necessary clarifications for a clear and sane understanding of Islam and its characteristics of civilization, diversity and tolerance towards other cultures and civilizations. It is important to popularize the concept of Halal tourism and to correct the general perception that summarizes this segment in the visit of Islamic holy places and historical and religious sites in Muslim countries.

6. Implications, limitations and future researches

This paper builds on the work of Smith et al. (2013) for a better understanding and discussion of the nature and uses of the different scientific theories discussed in articles that deal with Halal tourism, which has sparked a growing debate in tourism and hospitality studies. As argued by Smith et al. (2013), the heterogeneity of theory use can lead to misunderstandings and misrepresentations of a model's position or findings that pertain to Halal tourism research. The lack of precision in the vocabulary used to understand a social phenomenon such as Halal tourism will not advance scientific and social understanding of the nature, structure and dynamics of tourism, hospitality and leisure.

In addition to contributions to theory, this paper provides more information to various players in the tourism sector in terms of how to accommodate tourists who identify as practicing Muslims and also in terms of competitive advantage. A large number of Muslims in the world impose rules on sector players who want to benefit from this niche. Admittedly, there are a few countries that have started to put in place a legal framework and standardize the rules for this type of clientele, such as Indonesia, but this is not the case for the majority of other countries. This literature review can be a source of information for government institutions when setting up a legal framework.

However, a few possible limitations of this study should be cited. Data collection was limited to fourteen Anglophone journals indexed in the SCOPUS database. In fact, journals not included in the Scopus database and research conducted using other languages other than English could have been integrated to further discuss the issue. The classification of types of theories adopted by Smith et al. (2013) may be subject to discussion by other researchers.

Therefore, it is suggested that "Vosviewer" or other qualitative applied research programs be used to further explore gaps in journal topics, theories, and methods in future research. Comparative studies of existing research as well as the shortcomings of future journals can be investigated in the new research. Also, the gap between the previous research and the existing facts can be the subject of an investigation by other researchers.

References

Abror, A., Wardi, Y., Trinanda, O., & Patrisia, D. (2019). The impact of Halal tourism, customer engagement on satisfaction: Moderating effect of religiosity. *Asia Pacific Journal of Tourism Research, 24*(7), 633–643. https://doi.org/10.1080/10941665.2019.1611609

Adinugraha, H. H., Nasution, I. F. A., Faisal, F., Daulay, M., Harahap, I., Wildan, T., Takhim, M., Riyadi, A., & Purwanto, A. (2021). Halal Tourism in Indonesia: An Indonesian Council of Ulama National Sharia Board Fatwa Perspective. *The Journal of Asian Finance, Economics and Business, 8*(3), 665–673. https://doi.org/10.13106/jafeb.2021.vol8.no3.0665

Ainin, S., Feizollah, A., Anuar, N. B., & Abdullah, N. A. (2020). Sentiment analyses of multilingual tweets on halal tourism. *Tourism Management Perspectives, 34*, 100658. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.tmp.2020.100658

Aji, H. M., Muslichah, I., & Seftyono, C. (2020). The determinants of Muslim travellers' intention to visit non-Islamic countries: A halal tourism implication. *Journal of Islamic Marketing, 12*(8), 1553–1576. https://doi.org/10.1108/JIMA-03-2020-0075

Aladag, O. F., Köseoglu, M. A., King, B., & Mehraliyev, F. (2020). Strategy implementation research in hospitality and tourism: Current status and future potential. *International Journal of Hospitality Management, 88*, 102556. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.ijhm.2020.102556

Al-Qaradawi, Y. (2013). *The Lawful and the Prohibited in Islam*. The Other Press.

Azizzadeh, F. (2019). Pathology of Tourist Attraction Problems in St. Mary Church of Urmia. *Journal of Environmental Management and Tourism, 10*(8), 1956-1962. https://doi.org/10.14505//jemt.v10.8(40).25

Battour, M. M., Battor, M. M., & Ismail, M. (2012). The mediating role of tourist satisfaction: A study of Muslim tourists in Malaysia. *Journal of travel & Tourism Marketing, 29*(3), 279–297. https://doi.org/10.1080/10548408.2012.666174

Battour, M., Hakimian, F., Ismail, M., & Boğan, E. (2018). The perception of non-Muslim tourists towards halal tourism: Evidence from Turkey and Malaysia. *Journal of Islamic Marketing, 9*(4), 823–840. https://doi.org/10.1108/JIMA-07-2017-0072

Battour, M., Ismail, M. N., & Battor, M. (2010). Toward a halal tourism market. *Tourism Analysis, 15*(4), 461–470. https://doi.org/10.3727/108354210X12864727453304

Battour, M., & Ismail, M. N. (2014). The role of destination attributes in Islamic tourism. *SHS Web of Conferences*. https://doi.org/10.1051/shsconf/20141201077

Battour, M., & Ismail, M. N. (2016). Halal tourism: Concepts, practises, challenges and future. *Tourism management perspectives, 19*, 150-154

Battour, M., Ismail, M. N., & Battor, M. (2011). The impact of destination attributes on Muslim tourist's choice. International Journal of Tourism Research, 13(6), 527–540. https://doi.org/10.1002/jtr.824

Battour, M., Ismail, M. N., Battor, M., & Awais, M. (2017). Islamic tourism: An empirical examination of travel motivation and satisfaction in Malaysia. *Current Issues in Tourism, 20*(1), 50–67. https://doi.org/10.1080/13683500.2014.965665

Belezas, F., & Daniel, A. D. (2022). Innovation in the sharing economy: A systematic literature review and research framework. *Technovation*, 102509. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.technovation.2022.102509

Boğan, E., & Sarıışık, M. (2019). Halal tourism: conceptual and practical challenges. *Journal of Islamic Marketing, 10*(1), 87-96. https://doi.org/10.1108/JIMA-06-2017-0066

Brdesee, H., Corbitt, B., & Pittayachawan, S. (2013). Barriers and motivations affecting information systems usage by Hajj-Umrah religious tourism operators in Saudi Arabia. *Australasian Journal of Information Systems, 18*(1), 5–23.

Carboni, M., & Idrissi Janati, M. h. (2016). Halal tourism de facto: A case from Fez. *Tourism Management Perspectives, 19*, 155–159. doi: 10.1016/j.tmp.2015.12.007

Carboni, M., Perelli, C., & Sistu, G. (2014). Is Islamic tourism a viable option for Tunisian tourism? Insights from Djerba. *Tourism Management Perspectives, 11*, 1–9. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.tmp.2014.02.002

Carboni, M., Perelli, C., & Sistu, G. (2017). Developing tourism products in line with Islamic beliefs: Some insights from Nabeul–Hammamet. *The Journal of North African Studies, 22*(1), 87–108. https://doi.org/10.1080/13629387.2016.1239078

Chandra, G. R. (2014). Halal tourism; a new goldmine for tourism. *International Journal of Business Management & Research, 4*(6), 45–62.

Chanin, O., Sriprasert, P., Rahman, H. A., & Don, M. S. (2015). Guidelines on Halal Tourism Management in the Andaman Sea Coast of Thailand. *Journal of Economics, Business and Management, 3*(8), 791–794. https://doi.org/10.7763/JOEBM.2015.V3.287

Dash, G., & Paul, J. (2021). CB-SEM vs PLS-SEM methods for research in social sciences and technology forecasting. *Technological Forecasting and Social Change, 173*, 121092. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.techfore.2021.121092

Demirel, Y., & Yaşarsoy, E. (2017). Exploring consumer attitudes towards halal products. *Journal of Tourismology, 3*(1), 34-43.

Denyer, D., & Tranfield, D. (2009). Producing a systematic review. In D. A. Buchanan & A. Bryman (Eds.), *The Sage handbook of organizational research methods* (pp. 671–689). Sage Publications Ltd.

Desrochers, N., Bowman, T. D., Haustein, S., Mongeon, P., Quan-Haase, A., Paul-Hus, A., Costas, R., Larivière, V., Pecoskie, J., & Tsou, A. (2015). Authorship, Patents, Citations, Acknowledgments, Tweets, Reader Counts and the Multifaceted Reward System of Science. *Proceedings of the Association for Information Science and Technology, 52*(1), 1–4. https://doi.org/10.1002/pra2.2015.145052010013

Dhir, A., Talwar, S., Kaur, P., & Malibari, A. (2020). Food waste in hospitality and food services: A systematic literature review and framework development approach. *Journal of Cleaner Production, 270*, 122861. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.jclepro.2020.122861

Din, K. H. (1989). Islam and tourism: Patterns, issues, and options. *Annals of tourism research, 16*(4), 542-563. https://doi.org/10.1016/0160-7383(89)90008-X

Douglass, S. L., & Shaikh, M. A. (2004). Defining Islamic Education: Differentiation and Applications. *Current Issues in Comparative Education, 7*(1), 5–18.

Eid, R., & El-Gohary, H. (2015). Muslim tourist perceived value in the hospitality and tourism industry. *Journal of Travel Research, 54*(6), 774–787. https://doi.org/10.1177/0047287514532367

El-Gohary, H. (2016). Halal tourism, is it really Halal? *Tourism Management Perspectives, 19*, 124–130. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.tmp.2015.12.013

Future Market Insights, Halal Tourism Market (2022-2032), available at https://www.futuremarketinsights.com/reports/halal-tourism-industry-overview

Gabdrakhmanov, N. K., Biktimirov, N. M., Rozhko, M. V., & Mardanshina, R. M. (2016). Features of Islamic tourism. *Academy of Marketing Studies Journal, 20*, 45.

Hair Jr, J. F. (2020). Next-generation prediction metrics for composite-based PLS-SEM. *Industrial Management & Data Systems.* https://doi.org/10.1108/IMDS-08-2020-0505

Harahsheh, S., Haddad, R., & Alshorman, M. (2019). Implications of marketing Jordan as a Halal tourism destination. *Journal of Islamic Marketing.* https://doi.org/10.1108/JIMA-02-2018-0036

Harzing, A.-W., & Alakangas, S. (2016). Google Scholar, Scopus and the Web of Science: A longitudinal and cross-disciplinary comparison. *Scientometrics, 106*(2), 787–804. https://doi.org/10.1007/s11192-015-1798-9

Henderson, J. C. (2009). Islamic tourism reviewed. *Tourism Recreation Research, 34*(2), 207-211. https://doi.org/10.1080/02508281.2009.11081594

Henderson, J. C. (2016). Muslim travellers, tourism industry responses and the case of Japan. *Tourism Recreation Research, 41*(3), 339–347. https://doi.org/10.1080/02508281.2016.1215090

Isa, S. M., Chin, P. N., & Mohammad, N. U. (2018). Muslim tourist perceived value: A study on Malaysia Halal tourism. *Journal of Islamic Marketing.* https://doi.org/10.1108/JIMA-11-2016-0083

Jafari, J., & Scott, N. (2014). Muslim world and its tourisms. *Annals of Tourism Research, 44*, 1–19. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.annals.2013.08.011

Jia, X., & Chaozhi, Z. (2020). "Halal tourism": Is it the same trend in non-Islamic destinations with Islamic destinations? *Asia Pacific Journal of Tourism Research, 25*(2), 189–204. https://doi.org/10.1080/10941665.2019.1687535

Juliana, J., Pramezwary, A., Yuliantoro, N., Purba, J. T., Pramono, R., & Purwanto, A. (2021). Perceptions, Attitudes, and Interests of Halal Tourism: An Empirical Study in Indonesia. *Journal of Asian Finance, Economics and Business, 8*(7), 0265–0273. https://ssrn.com/abstract=3881537

Khanra, S., Dhir, A., & Mäntymäki, M. (2020). Big data analytics and enterprises: A bibliometric synthesis of the literature. *Enterprise Information Systems, 14*(6), 737–768. https://doi.org/10.1080/17517575.2020.1734241

Khoiriati, S. D., Krisnajaya, I. M., & Dinarto, D. (2018). Debating halal tourism between values and branding: A case study of Lombok, Indonesia. *KnE Social Sciences*, 494-515-494–515. http://digilib.fisipol.ugm.ac.id/handle/15717717/20236

Kim, S., Im, H. H., & King, B. E. (2015). Muslim travelers in Asia: The destination preferences and brand perceptions of Malaysian tourists. *Journal of Vacation Marketing, 21*(1), 3-21. https://doi.org/10.1177/1356766714549648

Laachach, A. & Ettahri, Y. (in press). The effects of venture capital on firm innovation: The role of absorptive capacity. *International Journal of Business Innovation and Research*, *1*(1), 1.https://doi.org/10.1504/IJBIR.2021.10040201

Maedeh, B., & Mazhar, H. (2010). *Halal Food and Tourism. Prospects and Challenges*. Ch, 4, 47-59.

Mastercard and CrescentRating (2022). Global Muslim Travel Index. Retrieved 28.12.2022. Retrieved from Global Muslim Travel Index 2022 (crescentrating.com)

Mazrui, A. A. (1997). Islamic and Western values. *Foreign Affairs*, 118-132.

McKercher, B. (2005). A case for ranking tourism journals. *Tourism Management*, *26*(5), 649–651. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.tourman.2004.04.003

Mohsin, A., Ramli, N., & Alkhulayfi, B. A. (2016). Halal tourism: Emerging opportunities. *Tourism Management Perspectives*, *19*, 137–143. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.tmp.2015.12.010

Montenegro, Z., Marques, J., & Sousa, C. (2022). Understanding the concept of Industrial Tourism: A systematic review of the literature. *Hosted By The School of Hospitality and Tourism*.

Moshin, A., Brochado, A., & Rodrigues, H. (2020). Halal tourism is traveling fast: Community perceptions and implications. *Journal of Destination Marketing & Management*, *18*, 100503. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.jdmm.2020.100503

Mounesan, A. A., & Azgomi, S. K. R. (2020). Islamic and Halal Tourism in Muslim Countries: The Case of Iran. *Journal of Tourism, Leisure and Hospitality, 2*(2). https://dergipark.org.tr/en/pub/toleho/issue/56188/741293

Neveu, N. (2010). Islamic tourism as an ideological construction: A Jordan study case. *Journal of Tourism and Cultural Change*, *8*(4), 327–337. https://doi.org/10.1080/14766825.2010.521252

Oktadiana, H., Pearce, P. L., & Chon, K. (2016). Muslim travellers' needs: What don't we know? *Tourism Management Perspectives*, *20*, 124–130. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.tmp.2016.08.004

Papastathopoulos, A., Kaminakis, K., & Mertzanis, C. (2020). What services do Muslim tourists want? Uncovering nonlinear relationships and unobserved heterogeneity. *Tourism Management Perspectives, 35*, 100720. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.tmp.2020.100720

Pradana, M., Wardhana, A., Rubiyanti, N., Syahputra, S., & Utami, D. G. (2020). Halal food purchase intention of Muslim students in Spain: Testing the moderating effect of need-for-cognition. *Journal of Islamic Marketing*. https://doi.org/10.1108/JIMA-05-2020-0122

Prayag, G. (2020). Halal tourism: Looking into the future through the past. *Tourism Recreation Research*, *45*(4), 557–559. https://doi.org/10.1080/02508281.2020.1762044

Preko, A., Mohammed, I., Gyepi-Garbrah, T. F., & Allaberganov, A. (2020). Islamic tourism: Travel motivations, satisfaction and word of mouth, Ghana. *Journal of Islamic Marketing*. https://doi.org/10.1108/JIMA-04-2019-0082

Rahman, M., Moghavvemi, S., Thirumoorthi, T., & Rahman, M. K. (2020). The impact of tourists' perceptions on halal tourism destination: A structural model analysis. *Tourism Review*. https://doi.org/10.1108/TR-05-2019-0182

Rasul, T. (2019). The trends, opportunities and challenges of halal tourism: A systematic literature review. *Tourism Recreation Research*, *44*(4), 434–450. https://doi.org/10.1080/02508281.2019.1599532

Ratnasari, R. T., Gunawan, S., Mawardi, I., & Kirana, K. C. (2020). Emotional experience on behavioral intention for halal tourism. *Journal of Islamic Marketing*, *12*(4), 864–881. https://doi.org/10.1108/JIMA-12-2019-0256

Ryan, C. (2016). Halal tourism. *Tourism Management Perspectives*, *19*, 121–123. 10.1016/j.tmp.2015.12.014

Said, M. F., Adham, K. A., Muhamad, N. S., & Sulaiman, S. (2020). Exploring halal tourism in Muslim-minority countries: Muslim travellers' needs and concerns. *Journal of Islamic Marketing*. https://doi.org/10.1108/JIMA-07-2020-0202

Samori, Z., Md Salleh, N. Z., & Khalid, M. M. (2016). Current trends on Halal tourism: Cases on selected Asian countries. *Tourism Management Perspectives, 19*, 131–136. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.tmp.2015.12.011

Sarstedt, M., Ringle, C. M., Cheah, J.-H., Ting, H., Moisescu, O. I., & Radomir, L. (2020). Structural model robustness checks in PLS-SEM. *Tourism Economics*, *26*(4), 531–554. https://doi.org/10.1177/1354816618823921

Shakona, M., Backman, K., Backman, S., Norman, W., Luo, Y., & Duffy, L. (2015). Understanding the traveling behavior of Muslims in the United States. *International Journal of Culture, Tourism and Hospitality Research*, *9*(1), 22–35. https://doi.org/10.1108/IJCTHR-05-2014-0036

Smith, S. L. J., Xiao, H., Nunkoo, R., & Tukamushaba, E. K. (2013). Theory in Hospitality, Tourism, and Leisure Studies. *Journal of Hospitality Marketing & Management, 22*(8), 875–894. https://doi.org/10.1080/19368623.2013.771114

Smith, S., & Lee, H. (2010). A typology of 'theory' in tourism. *Tourism Research: A,* 20.

Sofyan, A. S., Abror, A., Putra, T. W., Muslihati, M., Sofyan, S., Sirajuddin, S., Katman, M. N., & Darussalam, A. Z. (2021). Crisis and disaster management for halal tourism: A systematic review. *Tourism Review.* https://doi.org/10.1108/TR-08-2020-0390

Sriprasert, P., Chainin, O., & Rahman, H. A. (2014). Understanding behavior and needs of halal tourism in Andaman Gulf of Thailand: A case of Asian muslim. *Journal of Advanced Management Science, 2*(3).

Stephenson, M. L. (2014). Deciphering 'Islamic hospitality': Developments, challenges and opportunities. *Tourism Management, 40,* 155–164. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.tourman.2013.05.002

Stodolska, M., & Livengood, J. S. (2006). The Influence of Religion on the Leisure Behavior of Immigrant Muslims in the United States. *Journal of Leisure Research, 38*(3), 293–320. https://doi.org/10.1080/00222216.2006.11950080

Suban, S. A., Madhan, K., & Shagirbasha, S. (2021). A bibliometric analysis of Halal and Islamic tourism. *International Hospitality Review.* https://doi.org/10.1108/IHR-05-2021-0038

Suharko, S., Khoiriati, S. D., Krisnajaya, I., & Dinarto, D. (2018). Institutional conformance of Halal certification organisation in Halal tourism industry: The cases of Indonesia and Thailand. *Tourism: An International Interdisciplinary Journal, 66*(3), 334–348. https://hrcak.srce.hr/206165

Suhartanto, D., Dean, D., Wibisono, N., Astor, Y., Muflih, M., Kartikasari, A., Sutrisno, R., & Hardiyanto, N. (2021). Tourist experience in Halal tourism: What leads to loyalty? *Current Issues in Tourism, 24*(14), 1976–1990. https://doi.org/10.1080/13683500.2020.1813092

Suhartanto, D., Gan, C., Andrianto, T., Ismail, T. A. T., & Wibisono, N. (2021). Holistic tourist experience in halal tourism evidence from Indonesian domestic tourists. *Tourism Management Perspectives, 40,* 100884. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.tmp.2021.100884

Swanson, K. K., & DeVereaux, C. (2017). A theoretical framework for sustaining culture: Culturally sustainable entrepreneurship. *Annals of Tourism Research, 62,* 78–88. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.annals.2016.12.003

Talwar, S., Talwar, M., Kaur, P., & Dhir, A. (2020). Consumers' Resistance to Digital Innovations: A Systematic Review and Framework Development. *Australasian Marketing Journal, 28*(4), 286–299. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.ausmj.2020.06.014

Tangvitoontham, N., & Sattayanuwat, W. (2022). Factors influencing Muslim tourists' decision making on choosing a destination: Case study of Muslim tourists from Organization of Islamic Cooperation. *Journal of Tourism & Development, 39,* 227-240. https://doi.org/10.34624/rtd.v39i0.30348

Templier, M., & Paré, G. (2015). A framework for guiding and evaluating literature reviews. *Communications of the Association for Information Systems, 37*(1), 6.

Tiamiyu, T., Quoquab, F., & Mohammad, J. (2020). Muslim tourists' intention to book on Airbnb: The moderating role of gender. *Journal of Islamic Marketing.* https://doi.org/10.1108/JIMA-08-2020-0253

Timothy, D. J., & Iverson, T. (2006). Tourism and Islam: Considerations of culture and duty. In *Tourism, religion and spiritual journeys* (pp. 202–221). Routledge. 10.4324/9780203001073

Tranfield, D., Denyer, D., & Smart, P. (2003). Towards a Methodology for Developing Evidence-Informed Management Knowledge by Means of Systematic Review. *British Journal of Management, 14*(3), 207–222. https://doi.org/10.1111/1467-8551.00375

Van Gorkom, H. J., Pulles, M. P., & Wessels, J. S. (1975). Light-induced changes of absorbance and electron spin resonance in small photosystem II particles. *Biochimica Et Biophysica Acta, 408*(3), 331–339. https://doi.org/10.1016/0005-2728(75)90134-6

Vargas-Sánchez, A., & Moral-Moral, M. (2019). Halal tourism: State of the art. *Tourism Review, 74*(3), 385–399. https://doi.org/10.1108/TR-01-2018-0015

Vasist, P. N., & Krishnan, S. (2022). Demystifying fake news in the hospitality industry: A systematic literature review, framework, and an agenda for future research. *International Journal of Hospitality Management, 106,* 103277. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.ijhm.2022.103277

Wacker, J. G. (1998). A definition of theory: Research guidelines for different theory-building research methods in operations management. *Journal of Operations Management, 16*(4), 361–385. https://doi.org/10.1016/S0272-6963(98)00019-9

Wardi, Y., Abror, A., & Trinanda, O. (2018). Halal tourism: Antecedent of tourist's satisfaction and word of mouth (WOM). *Asia Pacific Journal of Tourism Research, 23*(5), 463–472. https://doi.org/10.1080/10941665.2018.1466816

Yagmur, Y., Ehtiyar, R., & Aksu, A. (2019). Evaluation of halal tourism in terms of bibliometric characteristics. *Journal of Islamic Marketing.* https://doi.org/10.1108/JIMA-05-2019-0101

Zamani-Farahani, H., & Henderson, J. C. (2010). Islamic tourism and managing tourism development in Islamic societies: The cases of Iran and Saudi Arabia. *International Journal of Tourism Research, 12*(1), 79–89. https://doi.org/10.1002/jtr.741

Appendix

Table 4 | Summary of themes, methods, theories and findings

N°	Journal Title	Author(s)/ Year	Methods / Regions	Themes	Types of Theories/ Justification	Key findings/Suggestions
1	Annals of Tourism Research	Din (1989)	Secondary information Malaysia	Patterns, issues and options of Islam and tourism	*Type 5* World views and questions are legitimate to ask, scholarly enquiry, relatively open-ended, interpreting various phenomena as supportive of the relevant application.	Tourism development in Muslim countries is not evident according to the influence of Islamic doctrines, while in the Islamic religion, tourism and hospitality are encouraged. Factually, tourism planning, strategy and management are mostly influenced by the development evidence of non-Muslim countries.
2	Tourism Recreation Research	Henderson (2009)	Secondary information	Insights into the nature and significance of Islamic tourism as a human and commercial activity	*Type 5* World views and questions are legitimate to ask, scholarly enquiry.	The nature of Islam encompasses every facet of life and dictates adherence to laws that extend their impact to individual tourists, to the workings of the industry and the workings of government.
3	Journal of Tourism and Cultural Change	Neveu (2010)	Secondary information Jordan	Heritage and politics (utilization of patrimony, heritage and religious archaeology) in Islamic tourism development	*Type 5* The research design of the phenomena is considered a theory.	The author offers an interesting case study that offers lessons about the relationship between heritage and politics in the eye of Islamic tourism development, such as capitalizing on mausoleums and pre-historic (Islamic) personality as well as promoting the tolerance and inter-cultural dialogues desired by Western powers.
4	Annals of Tourism Research	Jafari and Scott (2014)	Literature review; Secondary sources of information	Encouragement of the discussion of Islam and tourism, a topic that involves both religious and secular issues, is of global significance and academic and practical importance in this field.	*Type 5* World views and questions are legitimate to ask, and scholarly enquiry, interpreting various phenomena as supportive of the relevant application.	The authors examine Islam and its relationship to and impact on tourism as a source of personal belief and socioeconomic development. Attention should be paid to the impact of tourism on Muslims as hosts and guests. In the presence of the recognition of the socio-religious principles of Islam, its global scope and its growing population, research on the influential links between the Muslim population and tourism could push back the boundaries of knowledge in this multidisciplinary field.
5	Tourism Management	Stephenson (2014)	An examination from a global perspective. Member countries of the Organization of Islamic Cooperation and non-member countries.	Islamic hospitality and its developments, challenges and opportunities	*Type 5* Expressed explicitly as essentially a broad worldview, scholarly enquiry	It is importantly asserted that Islamic products and services do not need to be developed and promoted just for the Muslim market; some non-Muslim market segments are interested to consume Halal forms of hospitality services mostly in respect of safety, lifestyle and social civility.
6	Tourism Recreation Research	Henderson (2016)	Consultation of literature review and secondary information, Japan	The phenomenon of the Islamic tourism, encompassing the particular needs of Muslim tourists and industry responses, in the case of Japan	*Type 5* World views and questions are legitimate to ask, scholarly enquiry, relatively open-ended, interpreting several phenomena as supportive of the relevant application.	This market segment keeps growing in Japan. It also foresees a potential challenge for the service providers. Efforts must be made to understand the defining characteristics of Muslim tourists and take action to meet their expectations.
7	Tourism Management Perspectives	Samori, Salleh, and Khalid (2016)	Library research Asia	Development of the Halal tourism concept	*Type 5* World views and questions are legitimate to ask, scholarly enquiry	While traveling, Muslims prefer and need to maintain religious rules and regulations, such as five times prayers a day, prohibition for women to travel alone without company, taking food according to the Quran (The Holy Book) and words of the Prophet (peace be upon him).
8	Journal of Destination Marketing & Management	Moshin et al. (2020)	One-day symposium including panel discussions of the questions. New Zealand	Opportunities and challenges in halal tourism. Tourism stakeholders' and communities' perceptions of halal tourism? Enhancing the image of halal tourism	*Type 5* World views and questions are legitimate to ask, scholarly enquiry	Lack of awareness and misconceptions about halal tourism in New Zealand. The basic requirements of Muslim and traditional tourists, such as the level of service, and their travel motivations are similar. New Zealand is Muslim-friendly, but there is not enough awareness to make it a halal tourist destination.
9	Tourism Review	Vargas-Sánchez and Moral-Moral (2019)	Literature review	Halal tourism: requirements Halal tourist profile, perceptions and behavior	*Type 5* World views and questions are legitimate to ask, scholarly enquiry	The tourism industry faces challenges that it must confront in order to evolve towards the authentication of the halal tourism offer, including the role of new technologies and the digital economy.
10	Tourism Management Perspectives	Mohsin, Ramli and Alkhulayfi (2016)	Secondary information	Awareness of the growing Halal tourism market segment and identification of the fundamental needs of this segment	*Type 5* World views and questions are legitimate to ask, scholarly enquiry, relatively open-ended, interpreting several phenomena as supportive of the relevant application	Food and beverage facilities certified by Halal Certification authorities to ensure compliance and confidence in the Halal tourism segment, 'no alcohol' policy in mini bars in the rooms, Muslim guests prefer to see Islamic symbols across the hotels, for example, directional arrows towards Mecca for obligatory prayers, training arrangements for non-Muslim staff to serve and handle Muslim guests.
11	Journal of Islamic Marketing	Yagmur et al. (2019)	Secondary data Literature review	Literature review of Halal Tourism from 1975 to 2019 by examining bibliometric characteristics and trends and developments in these scientific publications.	*Type 5* World views and bibliometric analysis of Halal tourism.	Studies in the field of halal tourism have seen a remarkable increase recently. These studies were mainly conducted after 2011 and showed a significant increase in 2016. The vast majority of publications were in the form of paper-studies and the average number of citations in the field was 3.1, and the number of h-indexes was seven.
12	The Journal of Asian Finance, Economics and Business	Adinugraha et al. (2021)	Conceptual review Literature research methods from authoritative journals, documents and books. Indonesia	Description of halal tourism in Indonesia according to the fatwa of the National Sharia Council of the Indonesian Ulama (DSN-MUI) and government regulations.	*Type 5* World views and conceptual scholarly enquiry about the need to put in place normative rules and a legal framework to govern Halal tourism.	The huge number of public demands for halal tourism visits in Indonesia resulted in the need for a legal framework and normative rules. The discussion about fatwa Number: 108/DSN-MUI/IX/2016 concerning the application of tourism based on sharia principles and West Nusa Tenggara Regional Regulation Number. 2 of 2016 regarding Halal Tourism.

13	Tourism Review	Sofyan et al. (2021)	Secondary data A systematic review	Literature review of the halal tourism industry, while studying the crisis and disaster management framework based on Islamic teachings.	*Type 5* World views and A systematic review.	Islam teaches many principles, behavioral responses and psychological responses to disasters and crises. Indeed, the benefit of halal tourism is that Muslims make Islamic teachings the basis for social resilience to disasters.
14	Tourism Management	Eid and El-Gohary (2015).	Structural equation modeling (SEM) UK, Egypt and the UAE	The evaluation of the symbolic consumption of the tourism package by incorporating Islamic beliefs and practices into Eid's model of consumer satisfaction.	*Type 2* Testable, transcending the researcher's own opinions or biases, its use is based on or is an extension of other applications of theory (management science).	Six dimensions of Muslim customer-perceived value, such as quality, price, emotional value, social value, Islamic physical attribute value and Islamic nonphysical attribute value are indicated to have positive effects on Muslim consumer satisfaction.
15	Tourism Management Perspectives	Oktadiana, Pearce and Chon (2016)	Secondary data Literature review	Identification of the comprehensiveness of the research and commentary available concerning the needs of Muslim travelers	*Type 2* Using coordinated management of meaning to test the existing studies (management science).	The analysts tracked down the need to more readily distinguish Muslim travelers' requirements from the culture standards, verbal and non-verbal correspondence, Life Scripting, and Relationships areas. The proposed examinations incorporate figuring out the job of a movement for individual prosperity in Islamic life, distinguishing the particulars of verbal and non-verbal communication with Muslim tourists, exploring the administration of the isolation of the genders in open sporting facilities, and supporting Islamic strict and comprehensive developments.
16	Current Issues in Tourism	Battour et al. (2017)	Partial least square Malaysia	Testing the relationship between tourism motivation and overall tourist satisfaction (OTS) with the availability of religion (Islam) as a moderating variable.	**Type 2** Testable, transcending the researcher's own opinions or biases, its use is based on or is an extension of other applications of theory (management science).	The relationship between pull motivation and tourist satisfaction is moderated by religion. The moderating effect of religion on the relationship between push motivation and tourist satisfaction is not significant
17	Asia Pacific Journal of Tourism Research	Wardi et al. (2018)	Partial least square. West Sumatera, Indonesia.	Halal tourism and customer satisfaction. Halal tourism and word of mouth	*Type 2* Empirical research Statistical analysis. Test the hypotheses proposed.	Halal tourism attributes impact significantly tourist satisfaction and word of mouth. There is no direct relationship between halal tourism attributes and word of mouth. However, tourist satisfaction is important as a mediator. Business owners/managers need to create a better program for halal tourism.
18	Tourism Review	Rahman et al. (2020)	Structural equation modeling (SEM) Kuala Lumpur and Putrajaya	Non-Muslim tourists' perceptions of halal products or services. Loyalty of intention for halal tourism destinations	*Type 2* The PLS method was used to examine the hypothetical relationship among the constructs and to measure the structural model.	Most non-Muslim tourists think that halal tourism products and services in traveling to Muslim-friendly destinations are subjective to discovering Muslim cultures. The prohibition of non-halal services and the implementation of halal food services are closely connected with the experience and value of travel. Tourist loyalty intention is assigned to the satisfaction of non-Muslim tourists.
19	Tourism Management Perspectives	Ainin et al. (2020)	Collecting tweets from Twitter. The application programming interface. Python script.	Popular destinations for halal tourism. Trends of the sentiment valence in relation to halal tourism	*Type 2* Testable, transcending the researcher's own opinions or biases, its use is based on or is an extension of other applications of theory (management science).	Using the extracted tweets, Japan was the most tweeted about halal tourism destination, followed by Malaysia and Indonesia. Halal tourism-related tweets about non-Muslim countries are more numerous than those about Muslim countries. Halal tourism is becoming popular and growing in countries like the UK, Canada and Spain. Halal tourism has acquired popularity as Muslims become more intrigued by international travel.
20	Tourism Management Perspectives	Papastathopoulos et al. (2020)	Partial least square. The United Arab Emirates.	Islamic nonphysical and physical attributes. Profile of Muslim tourists	*Type 2* The PLS method was used to examine the hypothetical relationship among the constructs and to measure the structural model.	Three complex segments of the profile of Muslim tourists are identified: utilitarian Muslim guests, independent Muslim guests and leisure Muslim guests. The need for hoteliers to develop customized services to cater to these segments.
21	Tourism Management Perspectives	Suhartanto et al. (2021)	Exploratory factor analysis test. Partial least square estimation (5-point Likert scale). Indonesia	Holistic tourist experience in halal tourism. Religiosity in halal tourism.	*Type 2* The PLS method was used to examine the hypothetical relationship among the constructs and to measure the structural model.	Five dimensions of holistic halal tourist experiences are identified: (1) the halal experience consisting of halal accommodation, (2) the halal facility dimension, (3) the recreational experience consisting of people at the destination, (4) escape & refresh and (5) the uniqueness & staff dimension. The paper reveals that the impact of recreational experiences on tourist satisfaction and tourist intention to revisit and approve outweighs the effects of the halal experience.
22	Current Issues in Tourism	Suhartanto et al. (2021)	Partial least square. Indonesia	Perceived value in Halal tourism. Tourist satisfaction in Halal tourism. Tourist experience in Halal tourism. Tourist loyalty in Halal tourism.	*Type 2* The PLS method was used to examine the hypothetical relationship among the constructs and to measure the structural model.	Perceived experience quality, halal experience, perceived value, and satisfaction are important drivers of halal tourist loyalty. People in the destination dimension have the greatest impact on the tourism experience with a visit, perceived value, satisfaction and loyalty.
23	Journal of Islamic Marketing	Harahsheh et al. (2019)	Empirical and quantitative (survey type) Muslim Jordanians in the cities of Amman and Irbid	Understanding of the concept of Halal tourism by Muslim Jordanian tourists. Examining the tourist's perception of Jordan as a Halal tourism destination. Implications of marketing Jordan as a Halal tourism destination.	*Type 2* Using descriptive, reliable, and explanatory factor analysis.	Halal tourism in Jordan has been established, but it needs to be improved and promoted. Jordanian Muslim tourists revealed significant positive motivation to travel to halal tourism destinations. Significant knowledge and experience in local halal destinations, but not in foreign halal destinations. Marketing strategies need to be initiated to highlight the importance of halal tourism and market Jordan as a halal tourism destination.

24	Journal of Islamic Marketing	Isa et al. (2018)	The partial least square structural equation modeling uses SMART–PLS the quantitative basis of enquiry. Malaysia	The theoretical foundations of Halal tourism and conventional tourism paradigms. Muslim tourists' perception of value in the context of tourist destinations in Malaysia.	*Type 2* The PLS method was used to examine the relationship between Muslim tourists' perceived value and tourist satisfaction.	Social variables and price had no influence on tourist satisfaction, whereas emotion, quality, and physical and non-physical halal attributes had a direct impact on tourist satisfaction, especially with the mediating effect of the destination experience.
25	Tourism Management Perspectives	Carboni and Janati (2016).	Semi-structured interviews Fez, Morocco	De facto views on tourism products in line with Islam prescriptions	*Type 4* Using existing theories without proposing testable empirical hypotheses (untested models).	Halal tourism has not yet duly conceptualized or defined even at the juncture of its rapid growth, for which there remains a certain degree of vagueness regarding this concept because of a loose definition and lack of full institutionalization in the Fez case.
26	Journal of Vacation Marketing	Kim, Im and King (2015)	*t*-test Malaysia	Exploring the emerging destination brand positioning typologies and to assess the competitiveness of Japan, Korea, and China have accommodated the preferences of Malaysian Muslim tourists	*Type 4* Using existing theories without proposing testable empirical hypotheses (untested models).	Malaysian Muslim travelers perceived Korea as a superior destination brand to China, except in the case of 'access to Muslim culture'. In contrast, Japan was perceived as having a better destination brand than China, except in the case of 'access to Muslim culture'. In the comparison between Korea and Japan as brand positioning, Malaysian travelers perceived Japan as a higher brand than Korea.
27	International Journal of Culture, Tourism and Hospitality Research	Shakona et al. (2015)	Semi-structured interviews South Carolina, USA	Exploration of the influence of Islamic beliefs and practices on the leisure and travel behavior of Muslims in Clemson, South Carolina	*Type 6* Grounded theory, inductive analysis and interpretation of data collected that was then presented systematically	The study identifies seven major themes that are critical for determining the leisure and travel behavior of Muslims in Clemson. These themes include the importance of mosques, traveling with a mahram, adhering to hijab and dress codes for men and women, avoiding alcohol and places where it is served, abstaining from pork, observing the holy month of Ramadan, and following dabiha practices.
28	Tourism Management Perspectives	Carboni et al. (2014).	Consultations with secondary sources. Observations and interviews with a group of 14 key informants. Tunisia, Djerba	The relationship between Islam and tourism. The recognition of the potential of Muslim-oriented tourism.	*Type 3* Analysis based on various sources: consultation of secondary sources, observations and interviews. Statistical analysis	The increasing interest in Islamic tourism seems to have not yet gained momentum in Djerba. Its development is currently not seen as a priority in Tunisia.