

The emergence of African religious pilgrimages as a local economic development tool

NOMPUMELELO LINDA * [LindaNO@unizulu.ac.za]

Abstract | The religious sector is another sector of tourism, and so this study aimed at establishing whether the pilgrimage destinations would be perceived as a socio-economic enhancer or contributor for the country. African religious pilgrimages can play an integral part of pilgrimage destinations of KwaZulu-Natal (KZN). The African religious pilgrimages can contribute to tourism development and subsequently to the general local socio-economic development of KZN as there are various significant pilgrimages. The emergence of African religious pilgrimages can create opportunities for people and stakeholders in the tourism sector to understand that it can contribute to tourism development and subsequently to the general local economic development of KZN which has several important pilgrimages. The purpose of this paper is to explore the emergence of African religious pilgrimages as a local economic development tool. The paper uses both the theory and document analysis to look at this phenomenon. Moreover, the paper uses Local economic development (LED) and Tourism value chains (TVCs) theories in guiding the lensing and framing of the questions and objective for this paper. The study adopted a mixed method research design; and applied a convenience sampling method of a non-probability sampling technique for primary data collection. IBM's SPSS version 27 software and content analysis were used for data analysis. The findings showed that while African religious pilgrimages have the potential to make socio-economy contributions, it is not yet perceived in that manner by local stakeholders (including municipalities) and religious leaders. The findings further suggest that the African religious pilgrimages can be used as a tool for local economic development. The study recommends that stakeholders to enhance the socio-economic potential of religious pilgrimages such that they promote them as tourism and/or socio-economic development stimuli within the study areas and elsewhere in South Africa.

Keywords | Religious pilgrimages, emergence, pilgrimages, local economic development, pilgrimage destination, pilgrims

* Department of Recreation and Tourism, Faculty of Humanities and Social Sciences, University of Zululand, South Africa.
<https://orcid.org/0000-0002-8951-9639>

1. Introduction

Pilgrimages are mainly about self-transformation and the acquisition of knowledge and status through contact with the extraordinary or sacred locations (Collins-Kreiner, 2016; Collins-Kreiner & Wall, 2015; Shinde, 2008; Shackley, 2001). Travel is categorised into a type of tourism and the reasons mentioned above lend themselves to the religious tourism category. This study is about religious tourism and its emergence on African religious pilgrimages on local development. There are a number of destinations that have become renowned for their religious tourism resources and their capacity to attract large volumes of visitors daily (Smith, 2012; Swarbrooke & Page, 2012). Pilgrimage destinations are usually sacred places such as shrines, temples, churches, and landscape features which are among the most ancient in religious tourism (Nolan & Nolan, 1992). Tourists, like pilgrims, are seeking authenticity, as evidenced by the fact that modern tourists include many visits to pilgrimage sites.

The pilgrimage is a journey whose worth lies as much (if not more) in the journey itself and the experiences that result from it as it does in the destination (Timothy, 2021, Collins-Kreiner, Kliot, Mansfeld & Sagi, 2017; Norman, 2014). In countries like South Africa where local governments are responsible for local economic development, mobilising all local assets is critical for developing sustainable tourism-led development pathways as well as improved inclusivity (Rogerson & Rogerson, 2020; Wu et al., 2019 cited by Ferreira, Liberato, Lima, & Fernandes, 2023).

It is believed that religious pilgrimages play a significant role towards the development of local economic. The study aims to explore the emergence of African pilgrimages as a local economic development tool within South Africa. The stakeholders who are supposed to facilitate local economic development seem not to be aware of the value that can be brought by these pilgrimage

destinations. Tourism is frequently considered as having positive socio-economic and developmental impacts at the regional level by delivering new external sources of money into the local economy (Lacher & Nepal, 2010; Telfer, 2002). African religious pilgrimages have a potential for the growth of local economic development because these pilgrimage destinations are visited annually by tourists and pilgrims, and this can contribute positively to the gross domestic product (GDP) of the country. Since the rise of tourism in the global socio-economy, its popularity as a vehicle for promoting provincial and regional socio-economic development has been evident (Aslam, Awang, Samdin & Othman, 2016; Sudarmo, 2005). Tourists and local communities would benefit from the emergence of African religious pilgrimages, and they would be able to see the value that they hold for pilgrims.

2. Literature review

2.1. Theoretical framework – The emergence of pilgrimage destinations and tourism opportunities

Studies indicate that local people are *somewhat* aware of the tourism opportunities that can provide social and cultural benefits to pilgrimage destinations (Lopez, 2020; Suntikul & Dorji, 2016; Patel & Fellow, 2010; Tarlow, 2010). While many studies and attention have been on underlying motives for the world's largest pilgrim gatherings, most motivations for travelling to pilgrimage destinations tourism service performance and economic trends (Timothy, 2020; Olsen & Timothy, 2020; Shinde, 2010). The emergence of religious pilgrimages has potential impacts on the local economy since travellers require some form of accommodation, food and drinks, transportation and facilities for recreation and shopping on the way, during

and after their visit to the pilgrimage destinations (Gyekye, Oseifuah, Nethengwe, Sumbana & Dafuleya, 2014).

The pilgrimage destinations have a positive economic spin-off, and it attracts millions of pilgrims (Apleni & Henama, 2020; Saayman, Saayman & Gyekye, 2014). While the religious pilgrimage leads to increased sales for businesses, it has also been noted that it does not generate additional employment (Saayman et al., 2014; Pillai, 2007). The regional economic and spending pattern of pilgrims in one of the largest pilgrimages in the world and the largest in Africa is witnessed during the emergence of religious pilgrimage in Moria (Saayman et al., 2014).

2.2. Local economic development theory

This paper presents a theoretical framework that informed this study that can assist in understanding the emergence of African religious pilgrimages as a tool for local economic development through various nodes in the value chain and subsequently on the socio-economic impacts of religious pilgrimages in the study area. The literature on local economic development (LED) arose from concerns about the benefits from economic development practice.

The local people are aware of the pilgrimage destinations and the tourism opportunities associated with religious pilgrimages. The local people sell souvenirs and food in the surroundings of these pilgrimage destinations. A local government can assist the entire pilgrimage destinations while at the same time local communities within the study area can focus on uplifting themselves (Binns & Nel, 2002). The best results are achieved if stakeholders and local communities pursue LED strategies in cooperation (Rodriguez-Pose & Tijmstra, 2005).

The development of tourist destinations certainly requires a local development strategy that

can accelerate the development of tourism in these pilgrimage destinations (Clausen & Gyimóthy, 2016). The development aspects of the religious pilgrimages can have a formulated local development programme that includes physical and non-physical developments including the construction of accommodation, clinics and culinary facilities and infrastructure such as roads, housing and so on.

2.3. LED in the context of this paper

The LED theory assists in identifying the benefits, if any exists, that local communities and religious pilgrimages can gain through tourism development in the study area. As a result, the LED was found to be very suitable to the study's objective. LED is an approach of economic development to improve rural areas and religious pilgrimages in terms of employment levels for disadvantaged and minority groups (Hudaefi & Heryani, 2019; Nel & Rogerson, 2016). The service delivery triangle relating to LED consists of three partners namely government, private sector, and local communities (Meyer, 2013; 2014). The tourism industry, including the religious tourism sub-sector, can drive the country's economic growth, reduce poverty, and create jobs at the local level (Ivanovic, Khunou, Reynish, Pawson, Teseane & Wassung, 2009). Tourism has always been at the centre of national, regional, and local development planning (Rasoolimanesh & Seyfi, 2020; Erul, Woosnam, Ribeiro & Salazar, 2020; Olya, 2020; Ivanovic et al., 2009).

LED is associated with enabling people to participate in their own development. This paper means a multidimensional process involving major 'changes in social structures, popular attitudes, and national institutions, as well as the acceleration of economic growth, the reduction of inequality, and the eradication of poverty' (Todaro & Smith, 2021). This paper does not view socio-

economic development simply as a practical issue to be studied impassively in a classroom. For LED to be adopted in this paper, development is the realisation of fundamental human values and the discovery of means to extend the fruits of these values to most of the world's population. These values include, but are not limited to, the opportunity for meaningful employment and the possibility to provide for one's self and family; sufficient food, shelter and other amenities for a better life above the poverty line; the opportunity for pursuing education and the increased quality of life it promises; a reasonable level of health care and so on (Rasoolimanesh & Seyfi, 2020; Hudaefi & Heryani, 2019; Khambule, 2018; Nel & Rogerson, 2016; Meyer, 2014, 2013; Rogerson, 2009; Ivanovic et al., 2009; Cypher & Cypher, 2008).

LED is central to local development in the context of tourism and socio-economic development. The ability to make meaningful choices within and around pilgrimage destinations, as well as the ability to express those choices through institutions that allow them to voice their concerns about socio-economic well-being of the religious pilgrimages (Seyfi & Hall, 2020; Sharpley & Telfer, 2015). When such a situation is achieved at the local level, the community is said to be socio-economically developed and empowered (Timothy, 2006).

This paper opines that stakeholder must adopt proper tourism planning after consulting with local people, investors and revenue should be used for the benefit of local communities. The local people are aware of the pilgrimage destinations and the tourism opportunities associated with religious pilgrimages. A local government can assist the entire pilgrimage destinations while at the same time local communities within the study area can focus on uplifting themselves (Binns & Nel, 2002). The best results are achieved if stakeholders and local communities pursue LED strategies in cooperation (Rodriguez-Pose & Tijmstra, 2005).

2.4. Critique of the LED theory

LED has been critiqued on the ground that it can lead to difficulties in defining the boundaries of local communities and thus, in defining target groups, project strengthening local institutions and undermine democratically elected governments. The initiatives can be dominated by local elites who often ignore differences between target groups and local authority structures and focus on more easily achievable and measurable outcomes, neglecting capacity building for collective action (Mansuri & Rao, 2004). LED has been incorporated into local or community development, and these poverty alleviation strategies have focused on social goals over the short term rather than socio-economic goals that are more broad-based and longer term. LED has been critiqued on the need to leverage support for community empowerment and to unleash local creativity and innovations. The criticism is taken both from a theoretical perspective and based on empirical case studies (Atkinson & Easthope, 2009; Wilson & Keil, 2008; Markusen, 2006; Montgomery, 2005; Peck, 2005), and to date seems to find little countervailing arguments and evidence on the opposite side.

In conclusion this paper shows that the emergence of African religious pilgrimages as an LED has the potential of enhancing the growth of tourism and socioeconomics in the areas surrounding the selected pilgrimage destinations (Shinde, 2020; Sharpley, 2009; Ying & Zhou, 2007). The use of LED theory was motivated and informed by the attributes identified in this study such as a lack of tourism development characterized by dire poverty, lack of job opportunities, non-existence of basic infrastructure and underutilization of natural and socio-cultural resources that are available at the pilgrimage destinations. LED theory have shared concepts of social change at the local level, socio-economic development fueled by local engagement and integration, enhanced communica-

tion technology resulting in global interaction and poverty alleviation resulting from tourism development potential (Nguyen, 2015; Muller, 2003).

The LED theory embrace the concept of social conditions, socio-economic developments, and the poverty alleviation standards within the pilgrimage destinations in order to benefit the study area/ elsewhere (de Sylva, 2018).

2.5. Tourism Value Chain Theory

Several studies found larger benefits for local communities when stakeholders can participate in the tourism value chains (TVCs) by 'linking' their labour, products and services to the industry (Rivera & Gutierrez, 2019; Spencer, Safari & Dakora, 2014). The TVCs generally result in power imbalances where stakeholders try to derive a larger share of value by gaining more power (Ford, Wang & Vestal, 2012). In TVCs, actors are interlinked and they collaborate to produce and distribute value for tourists (Song, Liu & Chen, 2013). In its most basic form, a TVC consists of links between 'nodes' formed by actors of tourism planning, primary suppliers, tourism intermediates and tourists (Romero & Tejada, 2011; Ford et al., 2012). The structure of these interactions creates experiential value that can be attained by tourists and/or pilgrims and a platform for stakeholders and local communities to connect their labour, products and services to the international tourism system.

The study can play the key role in mediating stakeholders in the web of relations of TVCs as it has authority and justification to deal with issues of collective interests (Bramwell, 2011). Pilgrimage destinations can do this by imposing requirements as well as incentives for tourism-related stakeholders to behave in a certain manner (Bramwell, 2011; 2010). The TVCs theory is suitable for this study due to its underlying commitment to governance and upgrading the current state of the study area.

The importance of TVCs theory and the potential opportunities it can offer to developing countries to integrate into the global socio-economy have grown steadily over time (Morgan, 2017).

2.6. TVCs in the context of the study

TVCs are influenced by many constituents that might be advantageous for the pilgrimage destinations even for the local communities, including those of integrated rural development, basic needs, participation and sustainable development. In this regard, the concept of TVCs has evolved to integrate many value chains that perform value-adding activities to bring a product or service from its original phase, through production and marketing, to dissemination and final disposal or recycling after use (Safari, 2017; Ogunmefun, 2015; Romero & Tejada, 2011). TVCs can help to alleviate poverty and promote local development by having primary, secondary, and dynamic effects on the local economy (Safari, 2017).

In the pilgrimage destinations under study, there is the need to improve education and employment levels and develop infrastructure and the socio-economic situation in general. Looking at the TVCs theory from a different perspective, it becomes evident that the collection of stakeholders and scales leads us away from the initial input/output simulations, traditional economic added value and economic multiplier effects (Pasoni, Marini, Belleri & Menna, 2020; Vaz & de Noronha, 2020). The pilgrimage destinations are situated in disadvantageous communities with lot of resources which are potentially advantageous. The study can be of benefit to these destinations if TVCs theory can be used in the study. Pilgrimage destinations can benefit the aforementioned people if they are aware of the opportunities that might be brought through tourism developments in the study area.

2.7. The critiques of TVCs

TVCs has been critiqued in so many ways, including the observation that local communities are invisible in the development of socio-economies. Local communities should be visible in sustainable or tourism projects so that they can feel like they are part of the process (Roberts & Tribe, 2008). These theories (LED and TVCs) all would also embrace the concept of social conditions, socio-economic developments and the poverty alleviation standards within the pilgrimage destinations in order to benefit the study area/ elsewhere (de Sylva, 2018).

2.8. The impacts of religious tourism on development

The impacts of religious tourism in the experience of Thailand are more on the intangible heritages include firstly the impacts on the society of the temples that become a tourist attraction to tourists who travel to the country more and more. This is especially so with those from the west who bring western culture into temples and Thai society leading to changes in the role of the temples (Buddhalerd, 2018). Secondly, the impacts on the temple environment, and thirdly the impacts on monks whose roles become more commercial (UNWTO, 2011). Thailand has developed the most proactive winning strategy to promote religious tourism by being one of the few Asian countries in the region that facilitates a range of religious tourism experiences (Choe & O'Regan, 2015; UNWTO, 2011). The advantages include physical infrastructure, education and social services. Its international standard airports and roads, the development of new products, an ambitious marketing budget and a 'scientific' approach have helped transform religion into an important tourism economic asset (Martins, 2022; Choe & O'Regan, 2015; Timothy & Olsen, 2015). Temples not only provide benefit to

communities at a local level, but they also have interesting histories or outstanding architecture and can attract many visitors from around the country (Buddhalerd, 2018).

Religious tourism has become one of the most important industries and sources of income in many countries. It has grown in popularity over the years, rivalling other festivals as a result of the increasing number of pilgrims it draws and the variety of activities it offers. Naturally, festival distinguishes out for its religious character as well as its ethnocultural, artistic, and sporting features. The annual gathering at Moria provides a major marketing and income-generating opportunities for local stalls and 47 entrepreneurs who sell anything from food to arts and crafts as well as accommodation (Saayman et al., 2014). Religious tourism has potential effects on the economic and cultural development of destinations that exhibit some religious component (UNWTO, 2017). Pilgrimages have potential impacts on the local economy since travellers require some form of accommodation, food and drinks, transportation and facilities for recreation and shopping on the way, during and after their visit to the pilgrimage destinations (Gyekye et al., 2014). For example, pilgrims and tourists tend to use hotels, various means of transportation and purchase food, drinks, gifts, souvenirs, clothes and spiritual items (Saayman et al., 2014). The ZCC pilgrimage has a positive economic spin-off, and it attracts millions of pilgrims (Apleni & Henama, 2020; Saayman et al., 2014). While the pilgrimage leads to increased sales for businesses, it has also been noted that it does not generate additional employment (Saayman et al., 2014; Pillai, 2007). The regional economic and spending pattern of pilgrims in one of the largest pilgrimages in the world and the largest in Africa that is witnessed during the ZCC pilgrimage (Saayman et al., 2014). In Limpopo where there is the ZCC annual pilgrimage, the tourism industry plays an important role in the economy of primary product-based region and understanding

of religious tourism in this context can be perceptive (Saayman et al., 2014). Moria as a pilgrimage destination is a hive of economic activity with or without the main two pilgrimages (du Plooy, 2018; Apleni, Vallabh & Henama, 2017). There are shops and stands set up where cooked food, vegetables, milk, bread, church-branded tea and petroleum jelly are sold.

ZCC pilgrimage might have negative impacts to other tourists from visiting the province during the pilgrimage (Nugraheni et al., 2020; Henama & Sifolo, 2018; Saayman et al., 2014). This is because of road congestions that serves to deter travellers to Limpopo province during the Easter weekend (Saayman et al., 2014). In particular, the socio-economic impacts of religious tourism include the influx of people and related social challenges, impacts on local communities and cultural values. The negative effects might partially offset the positive economic gains that the province derives from the pilgrimage (Saayman et al., 2014).

For South Africa as a country, this study has shed some light on the economic, social and religious benefits that accrue from the development and promotion of religious tourism (Gyekye et al., 2014; Sharma, 2004). There is also a possibility that the church could be positioning ZCC members to get potential customers (Thornton, 2010). The socio-economic impacts relate to the realisation of rural-urban linkages that have been made possible because of this religious event. Economically, rural and urban areas are linked by the reciprocal exchange of products. The presence of the religious gathering in Moria has seen improvements in road network that may not only help the pilgrims but may facilitate exchange between rural and urban agents (Saayman et al., 2014). The government (more especially at provincial level) has a duty to help Moria to boost its tourism and thereby attracting more visitors. For example, the areas surrounding Moria are always facing challenges of traffic congestion. The provincial government can introduce some mechanisms to alleviate the traffic

congestion (Apleni & Henama, 2020).

3. Methodology

A mixed method research design was adopted, which suggests that both quantitative and qualitative modes of research enquiry were used during the collection, analysis and interpretation of data (Taherdoost, 2017). This mixed method research design was seen as a formal, objective and systematic process for generating information about the chapter. The design is appropriate to collect the necessary data on "the contribution of African religious pilgrimages towards local economic development in the study areas," "locals' awareness of pilgrimage destinations versus tourism development," "tourism facilities and products packaged for tourists and pilgrims," "locals' perception on the emergence of pilgrimages as a benefit to socio-economic development," and "the district municipalities with pilgrimage destinations." This paper chose this methodology to develop accurate, objective and interpretative information. In addition, the design enabled the researcher to examine the causal relationships with the constructs used in this paper. The intention was to find out from the respondents/ stakeholders whether they perceive the emergence of African religious pilgrimages having a potential for socio-economies.

This paper explores the emergence of African religious pilgrimages as a local economic development tool in KwaZulu-Natal South Africa, using three district municipalities namely, iLembe, Zululand, King Cetshwayo and one metropolitan municipality which is eThekweni Metropolitan as case studies. Considering the locations of the pilgrimage destinations and shrines of six African religious pilgrimages, the researcher chose to employ these three district municipalities and one metropolitan municipality. The methodological approaches and strategies used in the study are covered in this

section. These comprises the research design, the target population, the sampling design and procedures, the sample size, the collecting and analysis of the data, and the validity and reliability.

Table 1 | Categories of the sample

Category of Respondents	No of respondents
Pilgrims who participated in 6 African religious pilgrimages and local communities within the study area.	410 ekuPhakameni (60) iNhlankazi Mountain (60) eBuhleni (60) Mount Khenana (70) Fatima (60) and Ngome (100)
Municipality Officials from 4 Municipalities	30 eThekweni Metropolitan (7) iLembe District municipality (7) Zululand (8) and King Cetshwayo (8)
Nazareth Baptist Church Ecclesiastes	5
Roman Catholic Priests	5
SAMPLES SIZE	450

Source: Author's own work

In accordance with the mixed method design, a survey methodology was employed to collect data. It also helped the researcher to choose a sample of respondents and provide each participant of the sample a standardized questionnaire. Ntshangase and Ezeuduji (2020;2019) assert that a descriptive survey design can be employed to examine a population's characteristics in order to inquire into potential research problem solutions.

The researcher used this period to collect data using questionnaires and face-to-face interviews. The respondents participating in the emergence of African religious pilgrimages were approached and requested to participate in the study, and only those who agreed and were easily accessible were interviewed. The questionnaire was chosen because it allowed the researcher to ask the questions consistently. Two sections comprised up the questionnaire. Section A: The categorical demographic variables included in the questionnaire sought information about respondents' gender, age, marital status, degree of education, employment, monthly

income, and type of employer or business. Questionnaire variable included pilgrims' profiles (categorical variables), perceptions of pilgrimage destinations as a socio-economic enhancer. Open-ended questions and ordinal variables on a 5-point Likert scale (1 Strongly Agree, 2 Agree, 3 Neutral, 4 Strongly Disagree, and 5 Disagree) were included in Section B of the questionnaire. The ordinal variables originate from the literature study of this paper. The interviews were transcribed to closely appraise the data (Kerrin et al., 2017).

The respondents were selected at their destinations and at the corresponding shrines. Using IBM SPSS version 28 software, descriptive statistics were used in the initial stage of data analysis to generate percentage frequencies for respondents. Content analysis, a computer-assisted qualitative data analysis technique, was utilized to undertake the second stage of data analysis.

4. Discussion

This section presents a discussion based on the review of literature and how theories link with the objective of the study. Perri and Bellamy (2012) notes that the Mann-Whitney U test is often considered the non-parametric alternative to the independent t-test although this is not always the case. Qualitative data was analysed by means of content analysis which enabled the researcher to detect common threads from the open-ended responses. The common threads were then used by the study to generate themes and/or sub-themes from which the analysis were precipitated. The data were analysed mainly to address the questions and achieve the objective of the study. According to researchers such as Chingang Nde and Lukong (2010) data analysis does not provide all answers to research questions, but it does outline the achievement of objective and provides solutions to research questions.

Therefore, in order to corroborate or refute the study findings, the results and discussions are presented within the limitations established by the previous literature review, study objective, and research methodology. This paper begins by presenting the profile of the study (see Table 2). A total of 500 questionnaires were handed-out to respondents and 410 were fully completed and used for data analysis.

This section opens with a presentation and analysis of the socio-demographic data followed

by the demographic characteristics of travelling patterns of respondents. This was done mainly to determine the demographics of the study area and to ascertain if these (demographics) corroborate those that are discussed in literature review. Importantly, the study executed the said analysis to find out which demographic category(ies) participated most towards addressing the survey and achieving the objective of the study (see Table 2). These characteristics are presented in Table 2.

Table 2 | Respondents' profile (N=410)

Variable	Category	Frequency (%)
Gender	Male	46
	Female	54
Age	18-35	59
	36 and above	41
Marital status	Single	41
	Married	30
	Divorced	14
	Separated	9
	Widowed	5
Level of education	No Western Education	15
	Primary	8
	Secondary	15
	Tertiary education (Diploma)	17
	Tertiary education (Degree)	46
Employment status	Unemployed – Retired	48
	Self-employed – employed	52
Occupation	Unskilled	28
	Semi-skilled	25
	Skilled	19
	Professional	29
Income level	Less than R2000 – R10 000	74
	R10 001 – more than R20 000	26
Institutions of employment	National government	12
	Provincial government	16
	Local government	15
	Private sector agencies	15
	Community agencies	8
	Non-Governmental Organisations	8
	Labour organisations	3
	Other [Specify.....]	24

The results in Table 2 indicate that males who participated in the study were 46% while females constituted 54% of the total respondents. The reason for this distribution might be that the majority of pilgrims were females. These findings resulted from the fact that the number of females exceeds that of males found in religious pilgrimages within the area of study. According to Nugraha and Widyaningsih (2021) and Shuo, Ryan and Liu (2009), females constitute a higher percentage of religious pilgrims. In terms of the age variable, about 59% were between the ages of 18 and 35

followed by those who were between 36 and 56 above at 41%. The findings indicate that youths dominated in terms of participation in the study. Tiessen (2012) and Rinschede (1992) posit that youths visit the religious pilgrimages more than other age groups. This could be attributed to the reason that the majority of the country's population is young and they participate actively in any local development that may occur inside the study area.

The respondents were asked to reveal their marital status. This was done mainly to ascer-

tain the number of married respondents who participated in the study since marriage in many instances is associated with maturity. As shown in Table 2, about 41% of the respondents in the study area were single, 30 % were married. Those who were divorced accounted for 14%, separated were 9% and lastly widowed 5%. In the light of the above discussion, it would be interesting to establish whether the responses to religious tourism related matters would be influenced by the respondents' marital status. Dillman and Christian (2005) assert that marital status has an influence in substantive answers in the research as mature respondents are believed to more likely provide credible data in line with the topic.

The education levels of the respondents were considered as an important variable in this paper as it is generally affirmed that education creates awareness and understanding between people and their environments (Aminrad, Zakariya, Hadi & Sakari, 2013). The findings indicate that 17% of the total respondents had tertiary education/diplomas. Those who had tertiary education (degrees) constituted 46% of the total respondents. Based on the findings, it can be said that the majority was those who had post matric education. Those with a secondary education and those who had no Western education made up 15% of the respondents. Only about 8% of the respondents in the last group had completed primary school. Perhaps, this is due to the fact that most respondents were youths who have matric but never had a chance to further their studies at institutions of higher learning.

On the basis that the study sought to establish the perception of respondents of the emergence of religious pilgrimages for enhancing socio-economic development of the study area, determining the employment status of the respondents was considered to be important. The findings reveal that those who were unemployed- retired constituted 48%. Interestingly, the study found that the majority (about 52%) of the respondents were

employed and therefore had a source of income. This is a good result in favour of the study as it suggests that some of the employed respondents are hired by the pilgrimage destinations within the study area.

The findings indicated that 28% of the employed respondents lack technical skills, while 29% of the total respondents were professionals. Those who were semi-skilled accounted for 25% and the last category (skilled respondents) accounted for 19%. Although the total number of skilled 19% respondents are lower than that of unskilled respondents, it a good finding in favour of the study. This means that the more skilled and/or professional the respondents are, the more their chances of being hired at the pilgrimage destinations. Tourism resources can generate income for the majority of people in terms of improving their standard of living (Lapeyre, 2011; Briedenhann & Wickens, 2004). According to Telfer (2014) and Gursory & Rutherford (2004), the local community is likely to view tourism as something that reduces unemployment by creating new employment opportunities, creates new businesses and investment opportunities, generates additional business for locals and generates revenue for local communities and governments. Pilgrimage destinations can enhance the socio-economic profile of local communities in the study area. During the visit of the pilgrims, the local communities might grasp the opportunity of selling local souvenirs and cuisine (Nyau-pane, Morais & Dowler, 2006). The study concludes that the economic potentials of pilgrimage destinations are not yet well appreciated.

The socio-economic profile of the study area is fundamentally a rural area characterised by impoverished households. Against this background, the researcher found it important to ascertain the levels of income of the respondents. As presented in Table 2, respondents that earn less than R10 000 per month make up 74% while those who earn R10 001 and above constituted 26% of the total respondents. Perhaps, it can be concluded based

on the findings on education levels that the above finding had been influenced by the fact that the majority of the respondents lack tertiary education. This researcher holds the view that there is a significant relationship between education and income (Wolla & Sullivan, 2017).

As the nature of every research study, this study also found an important attribute during the collection of data regarding the socio-economic characteristics of the respondents. Table 2 indicates that about 16% were employed in the public sector at provincial level, followed by those who were employed by the private sector at 15%. Those who were employed by the public sector at local level constituted 15% and national levels accounted for 12%. Those employed by the NGOs and community agencies were 8%. The few employed by labour organizations made up 3% of the

total, while those who did not specify their employers accounted up to 24%. In view of this finding, it can be safely concluded that the majority of the respondents in this category were not comfortable with disclosing their places of employment.

The study to ascertain the awareness of the respondents regarding tourism opportunities that can be provided by pilgrimage destinations within the study area. The related research question is: Are local people at the pilgrimage destination aware of the tourism opportunities of the pilgrimages within the study area? In the subsequent sub-sections, the study presents the analysis and interpretation of data with the aim of achieving the objective of the study. The findings reflected in Table 3 suggest that there are no visible accommodation facilities within the study area.

Table 3 | Awareness of religious tourism opportunities _ perceptions and meaning (N=410)

Statements	Category	Mean	Std. Dev.	Frequency (%)
Do you think religious tourism have impact on the country's socio-economic change?	Yes	1.9488	1.64289	50
	No			38
	Not sure			12
Do you understand the concept 'pilgrimage'?	Yes	1.7049	.89455	55
	No			20
	Not sure			25
Are the local people of the pilgrimage destination aware of the tourism opportunities?	Yes	1.7878	.78889	40
	No			42
	Not sure			18
Who do you think are the key players responsible for creating the awareness of tourism opportunities in the study area?	National Government	2.0195	.68488	21
	Provincial Government			57
	Local Government			21
	Private agencies			1
Are there any tourism facilities and products that are packaged for tourists and pilgrims in the study area?	Yes	1.9707	.65533	22
	No			59
	Not sure			19
Would you regard the tourism facilities and products as contributing factor to the economic development of the study area?	Yes	1.5640	.63503	51
	No			41
	Not sure			8

The (local people) respondents were asked to express his or her opinion on whether religious tourism has an impact on the country's socio-economic development. About 50% of the total respondents indicate by saying "yes"; 38% said "No" and the minority 12% responded by saying

"Not Sure". The reason for respondents' response can be that they do not have an understanding of religious tourism as form of tourism. According to Fernandes et al. (2012) some studies revealed that the number of tourists travelling purely for religious reasons is relatively small.

4.1. Analysis of data for analysis and interpretation of data for the study

As mentioned in Table 3, this sub-section presents the analysis and interpretation of data for the study with specific reference to the following themes: (1) understanding the concept 'pilgrimage', (2) awareness of tourism opportunities, and (3) key players responsible for ensuring awareness of tourism opportunities. Table 2 indicate that the majority (55%) of the respondents understand the concept 'pilgrimage'. Those who revealed that they were not sure of their understanding of the concept under discussion accounted for 25% of the total respondents. Those (local communities) who do not understand of pilgrimage constituted about 20% of the total respondents. As a follow-up to the above question, the respondents were asked to state how they understand pilgrimage to be. One of the pilgrims said:

Theme 1

I do not exactly understand and/or cannot explain in detail what pilgrimage refer to, except that it is where we visit the holy site to worship God every year.

This revealed the pilgrims understand the concept in question. The reason for this understanding could be that pilgrimage leaders always explain the purpose of the pilgrimage to their followers. This assertion was confirmed by the response from one of the interviewed priests who said:

Theme 1

"Most pilgrims have been informed on the main purposes for pilgrimage".

Informed by the above findings, the study has arrived at the conclusion that the concept 'pilgrimage' is understood by the respondents. African Initiated Churches such as the ZCC and the NBC attract several million parishioners as well as wor-

shippers outside South Africa to their religious pilgrimages (Henama & Sifolo, 2018).

Awareness of tourism opportunities

The study sought to ascertain the awareness the respondents regarding (1) Socio-economic benefits that could be derived from tourists' visits e.g. multiplier effect, and (2) Socio-economic benefits that can be derived from religious-related activities e.g. its multiplier effect. Table 2 indicates that local people were not aware of the tourism opportunities that were available at the pilgrimage destinations. The majority (42%) revealed that they were not aware of the socio-economic opportunities that could be derived from visits to pilgrimage destinations, 40% said they were aware and 18% indicated that they were not sure whether there are socio-economic opportunities that might be derived from visits to pilgrimage destinations or not. Based on the findings, the study concludes that the respondents were not aware of tourism opportunities that can be derived from pilgrimage destinations. One priest gave the following reason for this lack of awareness:

Theme 2

Pilgrims are not aware of the said opportunities on the basis that if they were aware they would establish business enterprises that provide goods and/or services not provided within the pilgrimage destinations e.g. accommodation, culinary, artefacts, etc.

On the basis of the above responses, it can be safely concluded that the lack of awareness is due to the pilgrims' perception that pilgrimage destinations are to be used for spiritual restoration purposes only. This does not align with the assertion made by Rifai (2015) that apart from spiritual services, religious tourism also provides socio-economic development opportunities. Nicolaides (2016; 2015) concurs that socio-economic oppor-

tunities might be achieved if the pilgrimage destinations are well developed and/or sustained in the responsible manner.

4.2. Analysis of data for tourism facilities and products that were packaged for tourists

This section analyses data in order to address this study which was based on the tourism facilities and the products that were packaged for tourists in the study. The tourists are motivated by faith to participate in the resident trade by buying some souvenirs or leave some votive offering, which helps the reactivation of certain local craft activities (Fernández, 2010). The pilgrims understood the tourism facilities and products that can be accessible in the study area.

Data analysis for seeking if there are any tourism facilities and products that are packaged

This section presents analysis of data that were collected mainly to seek if there are any tourism facilities and products that are packaged for tourists and pilgrims in the study area. In a nutshell, the analysed data were collected from the pilgrims whom were believed to be able to identify tourism facilities and products in the study area. As shown in the Table 3, the majority (about 59%) indicated that there were no visible tourism facilities while about 41% said there were tourism products offered within the study area. Those who held an affirmative view regarding the availability of tourism facilities accounted for 22% followed by 51% of the total respondents who agreed that there were tourism products that were visible within the study area. Interestingly, the study found that the response rate with regards to those who were not sure whether tourism facilities were 19% and products existed in the study area was 8%.

Based on the findings as presented in Table 3, it could be said that there are no visible tourism

facilities available within the study area. Having said that, visitors and/or pilgrims were expected to drive approximately 100 kilometres to the lodging establishment of their choice and were forced to miss some of the pilgrimage events, which provides the facilities available within the pilgrimage destination. This finding, however, disputes what Nicolaides (2008) and Fernández (2010) assert that despite being attracted by faith-oriented activities, tourists also engage in other activities, such as exploring and/or purchasing on-site offerings, such as souvenirs, merchandise, etc. As a follow-up to the above question, it important to establish the respondents' in-depth views regarding the need for tourism facilities and/or products packaged for tourists and/or pilgrims within the study area. One of the Ecclesiastes said:

Yes, there is a need for tourism facilities and products that are packaged for visitors and pilgrims hence they normally require comfortable place to rest and/or refreshments. Thus, accommodations are not in the close vicinity tourists/pilgrims have to drive plus/minus 100 kilometres from the pilgrimage destinations which makes them to miss some of the events because some takes place during the night. The culinary facilities are highly needed to offer their services when required by either the visitors or pilgrims. During the pilgrimage only the stalls/vendors that sells food which some visitors or pilgrims expect just sit in a comfortable restaurant in order to enjoy their meals.

The above response aligned with that provided by one of the interviewed priests who said that:

Tourism facilities especially those that can cater for special needs, such as those for disabled pilgrims are highly

needed within the pilgrimage destinations. This would ensure that everybody who visits the destinations feel comfortable throughout their period of stay.

Despite the nature of the findings as presented in Table 3, an inference could be drawn based on the subsequent in-depth responses that there is a need for tourism facilities and/or products within the study area. There is stability around the world and in South Africa, little attention has been paid to the pilgrimage destinations and tourism development (Timothy, 2020; Olsen & Timothy, 2020; Shinde, 2010).

4.3. Analysis of data for establishing the perception of the respondents

The study aimed at establishing the perception of the respondents regarding the emergence of pilgrimage destinations for enhancing economic development of the study area. The respondents were 40 municipal officials, Roman Catholic priests, Nazareth Baptist Church Ecclesiastes and community members. The respondents were provided with statements that allowed them to reveal their level/s of agreement and/or disagreement regarding the emergence of pilgrimage destinations for enhancing socio-economic development of the study area.

Table 4 | Enhancement of socio-economic development (N=410)

Statements	SA	A	N	SD	D
There is need for developing pilgrimage destinations in the study area.	29%	62%	7%	0%	2%
The development of pilgrimage destinations might enhance the socio-economic status of the study area.	25%	64%	7%	3%	0%
Pilgrimage destinations have a potential for enhancing the socio-economy of the study area.	26%	65%	7%	1%	1%
Tourism facilities in the study area could enhance the socio-economic development.	15%	72%	7%	2%	4%
Religious pilgrimages can be seen as socio-economic enhancement.	17%	22%	14%	18%	29%
Involvement of local people might enhance socio-economy of the study area.	22%	66%	7%	4%	1%
Availability of infrastructure could increase the socio-economy enhancement of the study area.	24%	61%	8%	2%	5%

As shown in Table 3, about 91% of the respondents agreed that there is need for developing pilgrimage destinations in the study area while 2% disagreed and about 7% were neutral. Those who agreed that the development of pilgrimage destinations might enhance the socio-economic status of the study area were 89%, whereas those who held a contrary view accounted for 4% and about 7% said they were neutral.

A significant proportion (87%) agreed that tourism facilities in the study area could enhance the socio-economic development with about 6% disagreeing. Those who were neutral for 7% of the total respondents. The response-rate of the re-

spondents who affirmed that religious pilgrimages might be seen as socio-economic enhancement was about 39% with about 47% disagreeing. Only 14% of the total respondents were neutral. Those who agreed with the statement which said that involvement of local people could enhance socio-economy of the study area were about 88%, while 5% opposed and 7% were neutral. The reason for this distribution can be that the respondents perceive the potential for the pilgrimage destinations.

A significant proportion (about 85%) agreed that the availability of infrastructure could enhance the socio-economic profile of the study area. Those who disagreed with the statement consti-

tuted only 4% of the total respondents and 11% were neutral. In view of these responses, the study concludes that pilgrimage destinations have a potential for enhancing the socio-economic status of the study area. The findings, therefore, corroborate the assertion made by Niezgoda (2011) that tourism activities including religious pilgrimages have been widely perceived as means by which the socio-economic profiles of various regions could be enhanced.

Perceptions of the socio-economic contribution

The study considered it important to solicit the perceptions of the respondents regarding socio-economic contribution of pilgrimage destinations. To obtain relevant and/or credible data in this regard, the respondents were required to express their level of agreement and/or disagreement to certain statements using a five-point Likert scale whose results are presented in Table 5.

Table 5 | Perceptions of the socio-economic contribution

Statements	SA	A	N	SD	D
Socio-economic contribution that can be brought by religious pilgrimages could change people's perception about the study area	29%	61%	8%	2%	0%
Availability of tourism facilities might be perceived as a socio-economic contributor for the study area	26%	69%	3%	2%	0%
Religious pilgrimages can increase the potential tourism developers in the study area	21%	60%	11%	1%	7%
Tourism development could draw potential stakeholders into the study area and that could contribute to the socio-economy of the study area	21%	69%	6%	3%	1%

The findings indicate that about 90% of the respondents affirmed that socio-economic contributions that might be brought by religious pilgrimages can change people's perceptions of the study area. However, 2% of the total respondents held a contrary view. Those who held a neutral view accounted for 8% in this regard. These response-rate in terms of those who agreed that the availability of tourism facilities might be perceived as a socio-economic contributor for the study area was 95%, whereas 2% disagreed. Those who were neutral were 3%. A total of 88% of the respondents agreed that religious pilgrimages can increase the potential tourism developers in the study area while 1% disagreed. Those who were neutral constituted 11% of the total respondents. Those who felt that tourism development could draw potential stakeholders into the study area and that could contribute to the socio-economy of the study area were about 90%, while 6% held a contrary view.

Those who were neutral accounted for about 4%. On the basis of the findings, the study concludes that socio-economic contribution that might be brought by religious pilgrimages might change people's perception about the study area.

Enhancement of socio-economic development

This paper used the Mann-Whitney U bivariate test to compare the differences between independent variables (respondents' profile) which are recoded to be nominal (2 groups) in form; and dependent variables (enhancement and contribution of socio-economic development statements), which are ordinal (Likert-scale) in form. The results in Table 4 and Table 5 show that there are some identified differences for some respondents' profile vis-à-vis enhancement and contribution of socio-economic development statements.

Table 6 | Reliability test and comparing respondents' perceptions on enhancement of socio-economic development compared with respondents' socio-demographic variables – 'age and gender'

No.	Statements	Significant Results	
		Actual Results	Explanation
1	There is need to develop pilgrimage destinations in the study area	N.S.	N.S.
2	The development of pilgrimage destinations could enhance the socio-economic status of the study area	N.S.	N.S.
3	Emergence of pilgrimage destinations have a potential for enhancing socio-economic status for the study area	N.S.	N.S.
4	Tourism facilities in the study area could enhance the socio-economic development	Z = -2.064 p value = .039	*Age group 18 to 35 significantly agree more than Age group 36 and above.
5	Religious pilgrimages can be seen as socio-economic enhancement	Z = -2.648 p value = .008	**Age group 18 to 35 significantly agree more than Age group 36 and above.
6	Involvement of local people might enhance socio-economy of the study area	N.S.	N.S.
7	Availability of infrastructure could increase the socio-economy enhancement of the study area	Z = -2.513 p value = .012	*Females significantly agree more than males.

Note: * Questionnaire were itemised along a 5-point Likert-type scale ranging from 1, Strongly agree; 2, Agree; 3, Neutral; 4, Disagree; 5, Strongly disagree

^b Mann-Whitney U test significance: N.S, no significant results; *, $p < 0.05$; **, $p < 0.01$. No socio-demographic influence regarding 'age' and 'gender'

Pilgrims and local communities were asked to indicate their perceptions of 'the enhancement of socio-economic development' within the study area and these variables were compared with the respondents' profile (age and gender). The pilgrims and local communities' perceptions of the enhancement of socio-economic development attributes show no significant relationships with the following statements compared with the respondents' profile: 'there is need to develop pilgrimage destinations in the study area', 'the development of pilgrimage destinations could enhance the socio-economic status of the study area', 'pilgrimage destinations have a potential for enhancing socio-economic status for the study area', and 'involvement of local people might enhance socio-economy of the study area'. However, those who are 18 to 35 years old significantly agree more than those who are 36 and above: $Z = -2.064$, P value = .039, with these statements: 'tourism facilities in the study area could enhance the socio-economic development'. Again, those who are 18 to 35 years of age strongly agree more than those who are 36 and above: $Z = -2.648$, P value = .008, with this statement 'religious pilgrimages can be seen

as socio-economic enhancement'. The results also indicate that the females significantly agree more than males: $Z = -2.513$, P value = .012, with this statement 'availability of infrastructure could increase the socio-economy enhancement of the study area'. Interestingly, this evidence suggests that pilgrims and local communities' perceptions of 'the enhancement of socio-economic development' has some relationship with the respondents' profile (age and gender). These results were supported by research findings of Sati (2018).

Pilgrims and local communities were asked to indicate their perceptions of socio-economic contribution were compared with respondents' socio-demographic variables – 'income level', 'age' and 'gender'. The pilgrims and local communities' perceptions on socio-economic contribution indicate no significant relationships with the following statements compared with the respondents' profile: 'availability of tourism facilities might be perceived as a socio-economic contributor for the study area'. The results in Table 6 show that, those respondents who do not earn more than R10,000 per month strongly agree more than those who earn higher are $Z = -2.655$, P value = .008,

with the statement: 'socio-economic contribution that can be brought by religious pilgrimages could change people's perception about the study area. Moreover, the results also revealed that those who are 18 to 35 significantly agree more than age group 36 and above: $Z = -1.980$, $P \text{ value} = .048$, with this statement: 'religious pilgrimages can increase the potential tourism developers in the study area'. Also, females significantly agree more than males: $Z = -2.239$, $P \text{ value} = .025$, with this statement 'tourism development could draw potential stakeholders into the study area and that could contribute to the socio-economy of the study area'. These results (Table 7) reveal that there is a relationship between respondents' pro-

file (income level, age and gender).

It can thus be concluded that the use of the Mann-Whitney U test has significance on the socio-demographic characteristics such as "income level", "age" and "gender" and can contribute positively on tourism development of pilgrimage destinations. As far as this study is concerned, it seems that female respondents are more goal-driven than their male counterparts, especially in terms of putting more efforts to deliver better and unique services and products to the customers. The researcher thus concludes that the potential of pilgrimage destinations for enhancing socio-economic development within the study area has not been perceived.

Table 7 | Reliability test and comparing respondents' perceptions on socio-economic contribution compared with respondents' socio-demographic variables – 'income level', 'age' and 'gender'

No.	Statements	Significant Results	
		Actual Results	Explanation
1	Socio-economic contribution that can be brought by the emergence of religious pilgrimages could change people's perception about the study area	$Z = -2.655$ $p \text{ value} = .008$	**Respondents who do not earn more than R10,000 per month significantly agree more than those who earn higher.
2	Availability of tourism facilities might be perceived as a socio-economic contributor for the study area	N.S.	N.S.
3	Religious pilgrimages can increase the potential tourism developers in the study area	$Z = -1.980$ $p \text{ value} = .048$	*Age group 18 to 35 significantly agree more than Age group 36 and above.
4	Tourism development could draw potential stakeholders into the study area and that could contribute to the socio-economy of the study area	$Z = -2.239$ $p \text{ value} = .025$	*Females significantly agree more than males.

Mann-Whitney U Test: Asymp. Sig. (2-tailed): *, $P < 0.05$; **, $P < 0.01$; N.S., no significant results. No socio-demographic influence regarding 'Days of stay'; 'Level of education'; 'Employment status'; and 'Hours travelled'. Tests conducted at 95% confidence interval.

5. Recommendations of the study

The findings from the analysis of data revealed that the religious pilgrimages are not recognized as a vehicle with which tourism and socio-economic development of the study area can be enhanced. Based on this finding, the study recommends that local people need to be involved in the decision-making processes regarding socio-economic development. The study makes this recommendation on the basis that local people are able to influence success and/or failure of any socio-economic endeavour taking place within their communities.

For the purpose of this study, local people (some of whom are pilgrims) can play a significant role in identifying felt needs during their period of stay in these sites. This would assist in ensuring that decisions are made or actions are taken based on stakeholders' concerns.

Pilgrimage destinations have important histories that even the future generation would be keen to hear and might even recommend other developments to sustain and preserve pilgrimage destinations. The protection of these pilgrimage destinations could enhance the symbolisms of pilgrimages hold including infrastructure, history, the geo-

graphical environment and natural resources. LED and TVCs theories might contribute to the sustenance of pilgrimage destinations.

6. Summary and conclusion

Based on the summary and conclusion of the study, the researcher found that the concept of pilgrimage is not understood within the study area. It was also found that the respondents were not aware of tourism opportunities that could be derived from pilgrimage destinations. The provincial government plays a significant role in creating tourism opportunities and there are no tourism facilities available within the study area as visitors and/or pilgrims had to drive approximately 100 kilometres in order to get the accommodation of their choice. The study found that pilgrimage destinations have a potential for enhancing the socio-economic status of the study area. The study also found that socio-economic contributions that might be brought by the emergence of religious pilgrimages can change perceptions about pilgrimage destinations. In line with the findings, it is concluded that the potentials of pilgrimage destinations for tourism development is included in the strategic planning document of the study. It can therefore be inferred that pilgrimage destinations have been perceived as having tourism opportunities in the municipalities under focus.

References

- Aminrad, Z., Zakariya, S. Z. B. S., Hadi, A. S., & Sakari, M. (2013). Relationship between awareness, knowledge and attitudes towards environmental education among secondary school students in Malaysia. *World Applied Sciences Journal*, 22(9), 1326-1333.
- Apleni, L., & Henama, U. S. (2020). Visitors' perceptions of Religious Tourism in South Africa: The case of Moria in the Limpopo Province. *African Journal of Hospitality, Tourism and Leisure*, 9(2), 1-19.
- Apleni, L., Vallabh, D., & Henama, U. S. (2017). Motivation for tourists' participation in religious tourism in Eastern Cape: A case study of Buffalo City, South Africa. *African Journal of Hospitality, Tourism and Leisure*, 6(2), 1-14.
- Aslam, M., Awang, K., Samdin, Z., & Othman, N. (2016). Chapter two community capacity and participation in sustainable rural tourism development in Sri Lanka. *Sustainable Tourism in the Global South: Communities, Environments and Management*, 28.
- Atkinson, R., & Easthope, H. (2009). The consequences of the creative class: The pursuit of creativity strategies in Australia's cities. *International Journal of Urban and Regional Research*, 33(1), 64-79.
- Binns, T., & Nel, E. (2002). Tourism as a local development strategy in South Africa. *Geographical Journal*, 168(3), 235-247.
- Bramwell, B. (2011). Governance, the state and sustainable tourism: A political economy approach. *Journal of Sustainable Tourism*, 19(4-5), 459-477.
- Bramwell, B. (2010). Participative planning and governance for sustainable tourism. *Tourism Recreation Research*, 35(3), 239-249.
- Briedenhann, J., & Wickens, E. (2004). Tourism routes as a tool for the economic development of rural areas—vibrant hope or impossible dream? *Tourism management*, 25(1), 71-79.
- Buddhalerd, P. (2018). The impact of religious tourism on intangible heritage within the temple. (Thai). *KKU International Journal of Humanities and Social Sciences*, 8(2).
- Chingang Nde, D., & Lukong, P. (2010). Using the SERVQUAL Model to assess Service Quality and Customer Satisfaction: An Empirical Study of Grocery Stores in Umea. Umea School of Business
- Choe, J. Y., & O'Regan, M. (2015). Religious tourism experiences in South East Asia. In: Griffith, K. and Raj, R., eds. *Religious Tourism and Pilgrimage Management: An International Perspective*. Wallingford, Oxfordshire: CABI Publishing, 191 - 204.
- Clausen, H. B., & Gyimóthy, S. (2016). Seizing community participation in sustainable development: Pueblos Mágicos of Mexico. *Journal of Cleaner Production*, 111, 318-326.
- Collins-Kreiner, N. (2016). The lifecycle of concepts: the case of 'Pilgrimage Tourism'. *Tourism Geographies*, 18(3), 322-334.

- Collins-Kreiner, N., Kliot, N., Mansfeld, Y., & Sagi, K. (2017). *Christian tourism to the Holy Land: Pilgrimage during security crisis*. Routledge.
- Collins-Kreiner, N., & Wall, G. (2015). Tourism and religion: Spiritual journeys and their consequences. In *The changing world religion map* (pp. 689-707). Springer, Dordrecht.
- Cypher, J., & Cypher, J. M. (2008). *The process of economic development*. Routledge.
- De Sylva, S. (2018). Taking back control: Issues and benefits of bottom-up redevelopment. *Procedia engineering*, 212, 348-355.
- Dillman, D. A., & Christian, L. M. (2005). Survey mode as a source of instability in responses across surveys. *Field methods*, 17(1), 30-52.
- du Plooy, S. (2018). 3 Meshworks, Entanglements and Presencing Absence: Pilgrimages, Eastern Free State-style. *Pilgrimage in Practice: Narration, Reclamation and Healing*, 26.
- Erul, E., Woosnam, K. M., Ribeiro, M. A., & Salazar, J. (2020). Complementing theories to explain emotional solidarity. *Journal of Sustainable Tourism*, 1-16.
- Fernandes, C., Pimenta, E., Gonçalves, F., & Rachão, S. (2012). A new research approach for religious tourism: the case study of the Portuguese route to Santiago. *International Journal of Tourism Policy*, 4(2), 83-94.
- Fernández Poncela, A.M. (2010). The Santo Niño de Atocha: heritage and religious tourism.
- Ferreira, F.A., Liberato, D., Lima, A.S., & Fernandes, P.O. (2023). Sustainable practices in daily life and in the context of tourism. *Journal of Tourism & Development*, 40, 23-34. DOI:10.34624/rtd.v40i0.31414.
- Ford, R. C., Wang, Y., & Vestal, A. (2012). Power asymmetries in tourism distribution networks. *Annals of Tourism Research*, 39(2), 755-779.
- Gursoy, D., & Rutherford, D. G. (2004). Host attitudes toward tourism: An improved structural model. *Annals of tourism Research*, 31(3), 495-516.
- Gyekye, A., Oseifuah, E., Nethengwe, T., Sumbana, F., & Dafuleya, G. (2014). Religiously motivated travel and rural tourism in Vhembe District of South Africa. In *SHS Web of Conferences* (Vol. 12, p. 01057). EDP Sciences.
- Henama, U. S., & Sifolo, P. P. S. (2018). Religious tourism in South Africa: Challenges, prospects, and opportunities. In *Global Perspectives on Religious Tourism and Pilgrimage* (pp. 104-128). IGI Global.
- Hudaefi, F. A., & Heryani, N., (2019). The practice of local economic development and Maqāṣid al-Sharī'ah: Evidence from a Pesantren in West Java, Indonesia. *International Journal of Islamic and Middle Eastern Finance and Management*.
- IBMCorp Ibm, S. P. S. S. (2022). *Statistics for windows*, version 28.0. Armonk, NY: IBM Corp.
- Ivanovic, M., Khunou, P. S., Reynish, N., Pawson, R., Teseane, L., & Wassung, N. (2009). *Tourism development 1*. Cape Town: Pearson Education and Prentice Hall.
- Kerrin, M., Mamabolo, M. A., & Kele, T. (2017). Entrepreneurship management skills requirements in an emerging economy: A South African outlook. *The Southern African Journal of Entrepreneurship and Small Business Management*, 9(1), 1-10.
- Khambule, I., (2018). The role of local economic development agencies in South Africa's developmental state ambitions. *Local economy*, 33(3), 287-306.
- Lacher, R. G., & Nepal, S. K. (2010). From leakages to linkages: Local-level strategies for capturing tourism revenue in Northern Thailand. *Tourism Geographies*, 12(1), 77-99.
- Lapeyre, R. (2011). The Grootberg lodge partnership in Namibia: towards poverty alleviation and empowerment for long-term sustainability? *Current Issues in Tourism*, 14(3), 221-234.
- Lopez, L. (2020). Filmic Gendered Discourses in Rural Contexts: The Case of the Camino de Santiago (Spain). *Sustainability*, 12(12), 5080.
- Mansuri, G., & Rao, V. (2004). Community-based and-driven development: A critical review. *The World Bank Research Observer*, 19(1), 1-39.
- Markusen, A. (2006). Urban development and the politics of a creative class: evidence from a study of artists. *Environment and planning A*, 38(10), 1921-1940.
- Martins, H. (2022). The economic impacts of Covid-19 on events. *Journal of Tourism & Development*, 38, 265-280. <https://doi.org/10.34624/rtd.v38i0.25863>
- Meyer, D. F., (2014). Local Economic Development (LED), Challenges and Solutions: The Case of the Northern Free State Region, South Africa. *Mediterranean Journal of Social Sciences*, 5(16), 624-634.
- Meyer, D.F., (2014). Local government and the creation of an enabling developmental environment. *Administratio Publica*, 22(1), 24- 46.

- Meyer, D. F., (2013). *An exploration of solutions for rural development: The case of the northern Free State*. NWU: Vaal campus.
- Montgomery, J. (2005). Beware the 'creative class'. Creativity and wealth creation revisited. *Local Economy* 20, 337-343.
- Morgan, C. N. (2017). *Economics of Catfish (Clarias Gariepinus) Production in Bayelsa State, Nigeria* (Doctoral dissertation, University of Nigeria).
- Muller, C. (2003). Making the book, performing the words of "Izihlabelelo zamaNazareth". *Orality, literacy, and colonialism in Southern Africa*, 91-110.
- Nel, E., & Rogerson, C. M. (2016). The contested trajectory of applied local economic development in South Africa. *Local Economy*, 31(1-2), 109-123.
- Nguyen, D. G. (2015). *Tourism, traditional handicrafts, and community economic development: a value chain analysis of Phuoc Tich Heritage Village, Vietnam* (Doctoral dissertation, Auckland University of Technology).
- Nicolaides, A. (2016). Marian tourism: Eastern orthodox and roman catholic pilgrimage. *African Journal of Hospitality, Tourism and Leisure*, 5(4)
- Nicolaides, A. (2015). Tourism Stakeholder Theory in practice: instrumental business grounds, fundamental normative demands or a descriptive application? *African Journal of Hospitality, Tourism and Leisure*, 4(2)
- Nicolaides, B. (2008). Suburbia and Community: Untangling a Historical Conundrum.
- Niezgoda, A. (2011). Survey on Poznan residents' attitudes on tourism development-in Polish). *Poznanu*, 37(37), 7-23.
- Nolan, M. L., & Nolan, S. (1992). Religious sites as tourism attractions in Europe. *Annals of tourism research*, 19(1), 68-78.
- Norman, A. (2014). The varieties of the spiritual tourist experience. *Literature & Aesthetics*, 22(1).
- Ntshangase, S. D., & Ezeuduji, I. O. (2020). Profiling entrepreneurial attributes based on the level of formal education: The case of Mtubatuba Local Municipality in South Africa. *GeoJournal of Tourism and Geosites*, 31(3), 944-950.
- Ntshangase, S. D., & Ezeuduji, I. O. (2019). The attributes of successful tourism-related entrepreneurs: a case from South Africa. *EuroEconomica*, 38(2).
- Nugraha, Y. D., & Widyaningsih, Y. A. (2021). The moderating role of gender and religiosity on the EMA model: An Indonesian Muslim pilgrim perspective. *Journal of Islamic Marketing*.
- Nugraheni, A. I. P., Priyambodo, T. K., Sutikno, B., & Kusworo, H. A. (2020). The Social Dimensions' Aspects of Sustainable Tourism Development Analysis: A Systematic Literature Review. *Digital Press Social Sciences and Humanities*, 4, 00001. <https://doi.org/10.29037/digitalpress.44348>
- Nyaupane, G. P., Morais, D. B., & Dowler, L. (2006). The role of community involvement and number/type of visitors on tourism impacts: A controlled comparison of Annapurna, Nepal and Northwest Yunnan, China. *Tourism management*, 27(6), 1373-1385.
- Ogunmefun, S. (2015). *Analysis of factor-product relationship in pisciculture value chain in Lagos State, Nigeria* (Doctoral dissertation, University of Nigeria).
- Olsen, D. H. (2020). Pilgrimage, religious tourism, biodiversity, and natural sacred sites. *Religious Tourism and the Environment*. Edited by Kiran A. Shinde and Daniel H. Olsen. Boston: CABI, 23-41.
- Olsen, D. H., & Timothy, D. J. (2020). 19 Contemporary Perspectives. *Pilgrims: Values and Identities*, 224.
- Olya, H. G. (2020). Towards advancing theory and methods on tourism development from residents' perspectives: Developing a framework on the pathway to impact. *Journal of Sustainable Tourism*, 1-21.
- Passoni, C., Marini, A., Belleri, A., & Menna, C. (2020). Redefining the concept of sustainable renovation of buildings: State of the art and an LCT-based design framework. *Sustainable Cities and Society*, 102519.
- Patel, A. & Fellow, L. (2010). *Religious Freedom in America: Constitutional Roots and Contemporary Challenges*. Norman Publishing.
- Peck, J. (2005). Struggling with the creative class. *International Journal of Urban and Regional Research*, 29, 740-770.
- Perri, P & Bellamy, C. (2012). *Principles of Methodology: research design in social science*. London: SAGE Publication Ltd.
- Pillai, R. (2007). Economic Significance of Pilgrimage: A Focused Micro Level Study from Kerala, India.
- Rasoolimanesh, S. M., & Seyfi, S. (2020). Residents' perceptions and attitudes towards tourism development: a perspective article. *Tourism Review*, 76(1), 51-57.

- Rifai, T. (2015). Opening Speech, by Secretary-General, World Tourism Organization (UNWTO). In *International Conference on Religious Tourism 'Fostering sustainable socio-economic development in host communities'* (Vol. 15).
- Rinschede, G. (1992). Forms of religious tourism. *Annals of tourism Research*, 19(1), 51-67.
- Rivera, J. P. R., & Gutierrez, E. L. M. (2019). A framework toward sustainable ecotourism value chain in the Philippines. *Journal of Quality Assurance in Hospitality & Tourism*, 20(2), 123-142.
- Roberts, S., & Tribe, J. (2008). Sustainability indicators for small tourism enterprises—An exploratory perspective. *Journal of sustainable tourism*, 16(5), 575-594.
- Rodriguez-Pose, A. & Tijmstra, S. (2005). 'Local Economic Development as an Alternative Approach to Economic Development in Sub-Saharan Africa'. A report for the World Bank.
- Rogerson, C.M., (2009). *Strategic Review of local economic development in South Africa*. Final report submitted to Minister S Shiceka of Department of Development Planning and Local Government (DPLG). Commissioned by DPLG and GTZ.
- Rogerson, C. M., & Rogerson, J. M. (2020). Racialized landscapes of tourism: from Jim Crow USA to apartheid South Africa. *Bulletin of Geography. Socio-economic Series*, 48(48), 7-21.
- Romero, I., & Tejada, P. (2011). A multi-level approach to the study of production chains in the tourism sector. *Tourism Management*, 32(2), 297-306.
- Saayman, A., Saayman, M., & Gyekye, A. (2014). Perspectives on the regional economic value of a pilgrimage. *International Journal of Tourism Research*, 16(4), 407-414.
- Safari, E. (2017). *A model of the contribution of information communication technology to the tourism value chain for pro-poor benefits in Rwanda* (Doctoral dissertation).
- Sati, V. P. (2018). Carrying capacity analysis and destination development: a case study of Gangotri tourists/pilgrims' circuit in the Himalaya. *Asia Pacific Journal of Tourism Research*, 23(3), 312-322.
- Seyfi, S., & Hall, C. M. (2020). Political transitions and transition events in a tourism destination. *International Journal of Tourism Research*, 22(4), 493-506.
- Shackley, M. (2001). *Managing Sacred Sites; service provision and visitor experience*. Continuum.
- Sharma, S. S. (2004). *Caliphs and sultans: religious ideology and political praxis*. Rupa.
- Sharpley, R. (2009). Tourism, religion and spirituality. *The Sage handbook of tourism studies*, 237-253.
- Sharpley, R., & Telfer, D. J. (Eds.). (2015). *Tourism and development: concepts and issues* (Vol. 63). Channel view publications.
- Shinde, K. A. (2020). Managing the environment in religious tourism destinations: A conceptual model. *Religious Tourism and the Environment*, 42-59.
- Shinde, K. A. (2010). Entrepreneurship and indigenous entrepreneurs in religious tourism in India. *International Journal of Tourism Research*, 12(5), 523-535.
- Shinde, K. A. (2008). Religious tourism: exploring a new form of sacred journey in North India. In *Asian tourism: growth and change* (pp. 265-278). Routledge.
- Shuo, Y. S. S., Ryan, C., & Liu, G. M. (2009). Taoism, temples and tourists: The case of Mazu pilgrimage tourism. *Tourism Management*, 30(4), 581-588.
- Smith, V.L. (2012). The cultural 'work' of tourism. In *The cultural moment in tourism* (pp. 226-250). Routledge.
- Song, H., Liu, J., & Chen, G. (2013). Tourism value chain governance: Review and prospects. *Journal of travel research*, 52(1), 15-28.
- Spencer, J. P., Safari, E., & Dakora, E. A. (2014). An evaluation of the tourism value-chain as an alternative to socio-economic development in Rwanda, Africa.
- Sudarmo, S. N. (2005). *A community-based approach to tourism in Indonesia* (Doctoral dissertation, Victoria University of Technology).
- Suntikul, W., & Dorji, U. (2016). Local perspectives on the impact of tourism on religious festivals in Bhutan. *Asia Pacific Journal of Tourism Research*, 21(7), 741-762.
- Swarbrooke, J., & Page, S. J. (2012). *Development and management of visitor attractions*. Routledge.
- Taherdoost, H. (2017). Determining sample size; how to calculate survey sample size. *International Journal of Economics and Management Systems*, 2.
- Tarrow, S. (2010). *Ritual, belief and the dead in early modern Britain and Ireland*. Cambridge University Press.
- Telfer, D. J. (2014). Tourism and Regional Development Issues. In *Tourism and Development* (pp. 140-177). Channel View Publications.

- Telfer, D. J. (2002). The evolution of tourism and development theory. *Tourism and development: Concepts and issues*, 35-80.
- Thornton, R. J. (2010). The market for healing and the elasticity of belief: Medical pluralism in Mpumalanga, South Africa. *Markets of well-being: navigating health and healing in Africa*, 9, 144.
- Tiessen, R. (2012). Motivations for learn/volunteer abroad programs: Research with Canadian youth. *Journal of Global Citizenship & Equity Education*, 2(1).
- Timothy, D. J. (2021). *Cultural heritage and tourism*. Channel View Publications.
- Timothy, D. J. (2020). 18 Religious Tourism and Pilgrimage. In *Cultural Heritage and Tourism* (pp. 417-441). Channel View Publications.
- Timothy, D. J. (2006). Empowerment and stakeholder participation in tourism destination communities. In *Tourism, power and space* (213-230). Routledge.
- Timothy, D., & Olsen, D. (Eds.). (2006). *Tourism, religion and spiritual journeys*. Routledge.
- Todaro, M. P., & Smith, S. C. (2021). *Economic Development*. Pearson
- UNWTO. (2017). International congress on religious tourism and pilgrimage. Retrieved from <http://europe.unwto.org/event/international-congress-religious-tourism-and-pilgrimage>.
- UNWTO (2011) Religious Tourism in Asia and the Pacific. *World Tourism Organization* (UNWTO), Madrid, Spain.
- Vaz, E., & de Noronha, T. (2020). *Sustainable Development in Southern Europe*. Springer Books.
- Wilson, D., & Keil, R. (2008). The real creative class. *Social & Cultural Geography*, 9(8), 841-847.
- Wolla, S. A., & Sullivan, J. (2017). *Education, income, and wealth*. Page One Economics.
- Ying, T., & Zhou, Y. (2007). Community, governments and external capitals in China's rural cultural tourism: A comparative study of two adjacent villages. *Tourism management*, 28(1), 96-107.